Alexander, Jeffrey C. "Notes." *Performative Revolution in Egypt: An Essay in Cultural Power*. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2011. 87–118. *Bloomsbury Collections*. Web. 26 Apr. 2023. <<http://dx.doi.org/10.5040/9781472544841.0006>>.

Downloaded from Bloomsbury Collections, www.bloomsburycollections.com, 26 April 2023, 10:09 UTC.

Copyright © Jeffrey C. Alexander 2011. You may share this work for non-commercial purposes only, provided you give attribution to the copyright holder and the publisher, and provide a link to the Creative Commons licence.

Notes

- 1 Fawzi al-Bushra, "Egyptian Revolution," Al Jazeera (Arabic), 28 January 2011, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JYuxjgU6yeE&feature=channel_video_title [accessed 10 June 2011].
- 2 Souad Mekhennet and Nicholas Kulish, "With Muslim Brotherhood Set to Join Egypt Protests, Religion's Role May Grow," *New York Times*, 28 January 2011, A10.
- 3 Charles M. Blow, "The Kindling of Change," *New York Times*, 5 February 2011, A17.
- 4 Cécile Hennion, "Un Mouvement de Contestation Gagne l'Egypte," *Le Monde*, 27 January 2011, 5.
- 5 "Egypt: Rage Against the Mubaraks," *Guardian*, 27 January 2011, 36. See also Charles Levinson and Sam Dagher, "Rallies Fan Out as Regime Closes Ranks," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 9 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704858404576133630107794342.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 6 Paul Mason, "Twenty Reasons Why It's Kicking Off Everywhere," 'Idle Scrawl Blog', BBC (online), 5 February 2011, http://www.bbc.co.uk/blogs/newsnight/paulmason/2011/02/twenty_reasons_why_its_kicking.html [accessed 10 June 2011].
- 7 Michael Slackman, "In Mideast Activism, a New Tilt Away from Ideology," *New York Times*, 23 January 2011, 10.
- 8 Mona El-Naggar and Michael Slackman, "Egypt's Leader Used Old Tricks to Defy New Demands," *New York Times*, 28 January 2011, A11.
- 9 Simon Sebag Montefiore, "Every Revolution Is Revolutionary in Its Own Way," *New York Times*, 27 March 2011, "Review" 11.
- 10 Emmanuel Todd, "Interview by Lara Ricci," *Il Sole 24 Ore* (online), 26 February 2011, <http://lararicci.blog.ilsole24ore.com> [accessed 12 June 2011]. These remarks referenced the interviewee's earlier

work, Emmanuel Todd, *Le Rendez-vous des civilisations* (Paris: Seuil, 2007), which laid out the case for demographic shifts transforming the Arab world, equated modernization with eventual democratization, and presented political ideology and culture as reflections of underlying population shifts.

- 11 William Sewell's early responses to Theda Skocpol remain the most interesting theoretical-cum-empirical statements of a more cultural approach to revolution. Writing in the context of conflict theory, Marxist revival, and newly institutionalist readings of Weber, Skocpol had set out the basic premises of a materialist emphasis on political-economy and state violence in Theda Skocpol, *States and Social Revolutions* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1979), modifying her position only to acknowledge ideology as an intentional manipulation of ideas in response to the religious revolution in Iran ("Rentier State and Shi'a Islam in the Iranian Revolution," *Theory and Society*, 11 [1982]: 265–303). Influenced by Geertz and the semiotic turn in French historiography, Sewell (William Sewell, "Ideologies and Social Revolutions: Reflections on the French Case," *Journal of Modern History*, 57: 1 [1985]: 57–85 and William Sewell, "Historical Events as Transformations of Structures: Inventing Revolution at the Bastille," *Theory and Society*, 25: 6 [1996]: 841–81) polemically challenged Skocpol's perspective, describing the French revolution as an "act of epoch-making cultural creativity" and "a momentous ... act of signification" (Sewell, "Historical Events," 852, 861). In the decades since, with the marked diminution of academic interest in revolution, the sociological literature has been pulled between abstract theoretical affirmations of cultural causation (e.g. Jack A. Goldstone, "Ideology, Cultural Frameworks, and the Process of Revolution," *Theory and Society*, 20: 4 [1991]: 405–53; Mustafa Emirbayer and Jeff Goodwin, "Symbols, Positions, Objects: Toward a New Theory of Revolutions and Collective Action," *History and Theory*, 35: 3 [1996]: 358–74) and concrete, historical examples of cultural effects (e.g. Mansoor Moaddel, "Ideology as Episodic Discourse: The Case of the Iranian Revolution," *American Sociological Review*, 57: 3 [1992]: 353–70; Jean-Pierre Reed, "Culture in Action: Nicaragua's Revolutionary Identities Reconsidered," *New Political Science*, 24: 2 [2002]: 235–63). But see the ambitious new work of Anne Kane, *Constructing Irish Nationalist Identity: Ritual and Discourse during*

the Irish Land War, 1879–1882 (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), which renews and elaborates a cultural-sociological approach.

- 12 For codes and narratives as the key concepts for understanding the power of relatively autonomous culture structures; for the centrality of meaning in social explanation and causation; and for a critique of the exaggerated role that non-cultural factors such as demography play in more traditional social scientific explanations, see Jeffrey C. Alexander, *The Meanings of Social Life: A Cultural Sociology* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2003) and Jeffrey C. Alexander, *The Performance of Politics: Obama's Victory and the Democratic Struggle for Power* (New York, NY: Oxford, 2010). For a recent cultural-sociological approach to social suffering and its cultural narration, see Jeffrey C. Alexander and Elizabeth Butler Breese, "Introduction: On Social Suffering," in Ron Eyerman, Jeffrey C. Alexander, and Elizabeth Butler Breese (eds), *Narrating Trauma* (Boulder, CO: Paradigm, 2011).
- 13 In the same month that Khaled Said was tortured and murdered – June 2010 – the anti-regime protest movement established the 'We Are All Khaled Said' (WAAKS) Facebook page to honor Said as a martyr and to inspire protests in his name. It contained two pages, one in English, and one in Arabic, both of whose administrators maintained anonymity for security reasons. In the final days of that struggle, the Arab language administrator revealed his identity. Appearing on a popular satellite television program in Cairo after being released from twelve days of captivity, Wael Ghonim acknowledged that he had initiated and led the Facebook project. In the final days of the struggle, the Egyptian became a heroic figure, not only inside the nation but outside as well. For example, *Time* magazine placed him at the head of its annual list of the hundred most important people of the year. Ghonim could perform as WAAKS (Arabic) administrator only until the day of his arrest, which was on 27 January 2011; after this date, another administrator or administrators took over, and remained anonymous. After Ghonim's release from prison, he offered posts on WAAKS (Arabic), but probably did not resume the full-time administrator role.

Both WAAKS pages played central roles in the days leading up to the revolution and throughout the eighteen days of protest that

marked the event itself, from 25 January to 11 February 2011. The English and Arabic pages differed substantially from one another, not only in substance but in tone. While the two administrators carefully followed one another's language postings, they did not work together and neither claimed to know the other's identity. The Arabic language page more often adopted religious idioms and its substance was more directed to immediate events, such as timing of demonstrations, advice about protective clothing and directions about where to meet. The English page was directed less to Egypt and the Arab region and more to the putative global audience, as I will elaborate in the final section of this essay. In my quotations from these WAAKS pages, grammar, spelling, and punctuation have been left as they were written, in the heat of the moment and often amidst great commotion, stress, and upheaval. The times and dates noted in the Facebook pages are those of Egypt.

- 14 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
- 15 Jeffrey C. Alexander, *The Civil Sphere* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2006).
- 16 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
- 17 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
- 18 David D. Kirkpatrick and David E. Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link that Shook Arab History," *New York Times*, 14 February 2011, A1.
- 19 'We Are All Khaled Said' (WAAKS, Arabic), 27 January 2011, 3.46 p.m.:
الحرية و الرغبة.. مطلب كل مصر شريف
- 20 WAAKS (English), 1 February 2011, 12.54 a.m.
- 21 WAAKS (English), 6 February 2011, 2.14 p.m.
- 22 Evan Hill, "Egypt's Rooftop Revolutionaries," *Al Jazeera* (English), 6 February 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/02/201126194730350605.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 23 Mahmoud Hussein, "Après la Tunisie, l'Egypte Cherche sa Liberté." *Le Monde*, 27 January 2011, 18.
- 24 Benjamin Barthe and Cécile Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne; 'On s'est remis à respirer normalement, la peur a disparu'," *Le Monde*, 3 February 2011, 6.
- 25 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."

-
- 26 Alaa Al Aswany, "Comment: Police Alone Can't Keep Rulers in Power. Egypt's Battle Is On," *Guardian*, 28 January 2011, 38.
 - 27 *La Repubblica*, "Scontri e Morti in Tutto l'Egitto. Il Presidente in TV: È Complotto," *La Repubblica*, 29 January 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/01/29/news/scontri_e_morti_in_tutto_l_egitto_il_presidente_in_tv_e_complotto-11795852 [accessed 22 April 2011].
 - 28 Anthony Shadid, "Street Battle Over the Arab Future," *New York Times*, 3 February 2011, 1.
 - 29 Bob Prail, "In the Mideast, Days of Tumult, 'To the Editor'," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A22.
 - 30 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
 - 31 Kareem Fahim and Mona El-Naggar, "Violent Clashes Mark Protests Against Mubarak's Rule," *New York Times*, 26 January 2011, A1.
 - 32 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Egyptians Defiant as Military Does Little to Quash Protests," *New York Times*, 30 January 2011, 1.
 - 33 Liz Alderman, "Arab Executives Predict Regime Change in Egypt," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/01/30/business/global/30davos.html> [accessed 12 June 2011].
 - 34 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Orders Crackdown, With Revolt Sweeping Egypt," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A1.
 - 35 Kareem Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians, Poor and Wealthy, Converge in Fight for Cairo Bridge," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A12.
 - 36 Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians."
 - 37 Anthony Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives and Wondering What's Next," *New York Times*, 30 January 2011, A1.
 - 38 David D. Kirkpatrick and Mona El-Naggar, "Rich, Poor and a Rift Exposed by Unrest," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, A6.
 - 39 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak's Grip Is Shaken as Millions Are Called to Protest," *New York Times*, 1 February 2011, A1.
 - 40 Shadid, "Street Battle Over the Arab Future."
 - 41 Shadid, "Street Battle Over the Arab Future."
 - 42 Al Jazeera (English), "Egypt Protestors Clash with Police," Al Jazeera (English), 25 January 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/01/201112511362207742.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].

- 43 Walter Ambrust, "Tahrir: Shock and Awe Mubarak Style," Al Jazeera (English), 3 February 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/indepth/opinion/2011/02/20112310224495606.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 44 Jack Shenker, "Egypt Awaits Nationwide 'Day of Revolution'," *Guardian*, 25 January 2011, 22.
- 45 Ahdaf Soueif, "Fittingly, It's the Young of the Country Who Are Leading Us," *Guardian*, 28 January 2011, 1.
- 46 Guido Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba," *La Repubblica*, 29 January 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/01/29/news/la_rivolta_che_cambia_la_storia_araba-11796023 [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 47 WAAKS (Arabic), 27 January 2011, 9.23 p.m.:
 : الكنيسة المصرية تجعو المسيحيين لحضور المظاهرات السلمية مع إخوانهم المسلمين ... الحمد لله و كلنا ايد واحدة لأن كلنا عايزين حقوقنا.
- 48 WAAKS (Arabic), 26 January 2011.:
 ستخرج بمسيرات في كل مساجد وكنائس مصر الكبرى متجهين ناحية الميادين العامة ومعتمدين حتى ننال حقوقنا المسلوبة. مصر ستخرج مسلميها ومسيحييها من أجل محاربة الفساد والبطالة والظلم وغياب الحرية. سيتم تحديد المساجد والكنائس ليلة الخميس.
- 49 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7.43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 50 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7.43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 51 Soumaya Ghannoushi, "Comment: A Quagmire of Tyranny: Arabs Are Rebelling not Just against Decrepit Autocrats but the Foreign Backers Who Kept Them in Power," *Guardian*, 29 January 2011, 32.
- 52 Thomas Friedman, "Speakers' Corner on the Nile," *New York Times*, 8 February 2011, A27.
- 53 Maureen Dowd, "Stars and Sewers," *New York Times*, 20 February 2011, "Week in Review", 11.
- 54 At the heart of the institutions and interactions of a civil society –

even one in *status nascendi* – is a binary discourse that contrasts a sacred, purifying discourse justifying liberty with a profane, polluting discourse justifying repression. For a detailed analysis of this binary cultural structure, and its necessary if ambiguous relation to democratic aspirations, see Alexander, *The Civil Sphere*. While the specification of this cultural structure differs according to historical time and geographical place – for references to variegated historical and national studies, see Alexander, *The Civil Sphere*, 573–4 – its fundamentals are universal, insofar as they identify the kinds of motives, relations, and institutions required to sustain a self-governing democratic order. That the same discourse so clearly propelled the movement of revolutionaries in an Arab, primarily Muslim, setting provides further evidence of this universal status.

- 55 Michael Slackman, "Compact Between Egypt and Its Leader Erodes," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, 11.
- 56 Robyn Creswell, "Egypt: The Cultural Revolution," *New York Times*, 20 February 2011, "Book Review" 27.
- 57 Creswell, "Egypt."
- 58 Slackman, "Compact Between Egypt and Its Leader Erodes."
- 59 The quoted phrases about the sacred and profane character of the Mubarak regime and its opponents are drawn from the regime's official press releases, from its speeches, and from anonymous, off-the-record statements to journalists. For the polluting quotations, see Slackman, "In Mideast Activism;" Fahim and El-Naggar, "Violent Clashes Mark Protests Against Mubarak's Rule;" M. Ibrahim Youssef, "Quotation of the Day," *New York Times*, 27 January 2011, A2; Mekhennet and Kulish, "With Muslim Brotherhood Set to Join Egypt Protests;" Kareem Fahim and Liam Stack, "Opposition in Egypt Gears Up for Major Friday Protest," *New York Times*, 28 January 2011, section A; David D. Kirkpatrick, "As Egypt Protest Swells, U.S. Sends Specifics Demands" *New York Times*, 9 February 2011, A1; Anthony Shadid and David D. Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Won't Quit, Stoking Revolt's Fury and Resolve," *New York Times*, 11 February 2011, A1. For the quotes sacralizing the regime, see Fahim and Stack 2011; El-Naggar and Slackman, "Egypt's Leader Used Old Tricks;" David D. Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Orders Crackdown;" Helene Cooper and Mark Mazzetti, "Prideful and Prizing Status Quo, Mubarak Resists Pressure," *New York Times*, 7 February 2011,

- A10; Anthony Shadid, "In the Euphoria of the Crowd, No Party or Leader Unifies the Opposition," *New York Times*, 1 February 2011, A11. While drawn from quotations in the *New York Times*, these characterizations were widely reported in the other media as well, including Al Jazeera (Arabic), e.g. Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7.43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 60 Simon Tisdall, "World Briefing: New Wave of Protest Takes Mubarak Out of Comfort Zone," *Guardian*, 26 January 2011, 22.
- 61 For these statements by the revolutionaries about themselves, see, e.g. David D. Kirkpatrick and Michael Slackman, "In New Role, Egypt Youths Drive Revolt," *New York Times*, 27 January 2011, A1; Fahim and Stack, "Opposition in Egypt;" Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians." For their statements about the regime and Mubarak, see, e.g. Kareem Fahim and Liam Stack, "Egypt Intensifies Effort to Crush Wave of Protests, Detaining Hundreds," *New York Times*, 27 January 2011, A10; Mekhennet and Kulish, "With Muslim Brotherhood;" Fahim and Stack, "Opposition in Egypt", Mark Landler and Andrew W. Lehrer, "State's Secrets; Cables Show U.S. Tack on Egypt: Public Support, Private, Pressure," *New York Times*, 28 January 2011, A1; Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Orders Crackdown;" Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians;" David D. Kirkpatrick, "In Protests, a Nobel Prize Winner Has an Unfamiliar Role," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A11; Neil MacFarqhar, "Egypt's Respected Military Is Seen as Pivotal in What Happens Next," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A13. Again, while these translated quotations are drawn from the *New York Times*, the same characterizations are widely reported, not only in American and European media but in Al Jazeera (Arabic) as well, e.g. Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7.43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 62 The intertwining of disillusionment with the post-colonial project and support for renewing civil society was represented in fictional form in the early 1980s by the great Egyptian novelist Naguib Mahfouz in his moral allegory: Naguib Mahfouz, *Before the Throne: Dialogs with Egypt's Great from Menes to Anwar Sadat* (Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press, 2009 [1983]). In the mythical Hall of Justice, Osiris, god of the afterlife, holds court in a trial of Egyptian rulers to determine who deserves to take a seat among the Immortals in the Hall of Sacred Justice or, instead, be consigned to

hell or purgatory. When Abdel Nasser appears before the tribunal, he is confronted by one of his famous predecessors, Saad Zaghloul. Nasser came to power in a 1952 military coup and championed state socialism, pan-Arabism, anti-Zionism, and radical post-colonial ideology. Zaghloul, Egypt's most revered revolutionary leader from the early twentieth century, was founder of the politically and economically liberal Wafd party. Warning that "leadership is a divine gift," Zaghloul admonishes Nasser that "it was in your power to build ... an enlightened, democratic form of government." Nasser replies, "true democracy to me ... meant the liberation of the Egyptians from colonialism, exploitation, and poverty." To this, Zaghloul's successor as Wafd leader, Mustafa al-Nahhas, angrily replies: "You were heedless of liberty and human rights [and] while I don't deny that you kept faith with the poor, you were a curse upon political writers and intellectuals ... You cracked down on them with arrest and imprisonment, with hanging and killing" (Mahfouz, *Before the Throne*, 135–6).

- 63 Reuel Marc Gerecht, "How Democracy Became Halal," *New York Times*, 7 February 2011, A23.
- 64 It is not an exaggeration to say that Western intellectual history has betrayed a deep skepticism about the very possibility of Arab democracy, from Greek tropes about Persian barbarism to Marx's Asiatic mode of production, Weber's sultanism and warrior religion, and the civilizational claims of such contemporary conservatives as Samuel Huntington. Over the last three decades, this "Orientalism" has been called out, not only by Edward Said's sweeping Foucaultian critique (Edward Said, *Orientalism* [New York, NY: Vintage, 1979]) but by painstaking works of historical-cum-philosophical scholarship, such as Patricia Springborg, "Politics, Primordialism, and Orientalism: Marx, Aristotle, and the Myth of the *Gemeinschaft*," *American Political Science Review*, 80: 1 (1986): 185–211 and Patricia Springborg, *Western Republicanism and the Oriental Prince* (London: Polity, 1992)). It was during this same period that important currents in Arab intellectual life initiated a far-reaching break with "Occidentalism," the defensive mirror image of Orientalism that, especially with the rise of the anti-colonial movement, denigrates various elements of Western modernity, especially those having to do with civil society and democracy. As state communism crumbled abroad and Pan-Arab socialism foundered at home, Islamicism

certainly continued to provide for some in North Africa and the Middle East an Occidentalist alternative. There also emerged, however, a new openness, a new grappling with Western intellectual traditions and, most remarkably, with the idea of civil society. Almost two decades ago, al-Azmeh (A. al-Azmeh, *Democracy without Democrats: The Renewal of Politics in the Arab World* [London: I.B. Tauris, 1994]) already observed "the ubiquity of Arab discourse on democracy in recent years," how "together with ... the notion of civil society [it] is addressed in the Arab world in a myriad of political, academic, journalist and other writings," and how it "is the subject of inveterate commentary in casual conversation." Two years after that, in Michelle L. Browsers, *Democracy and Civil Society in Arab Political Thought: Transcultural Possibilities* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2006), Browsers documented that among Arabic intellectuals "in the latter part of the 1980s, a literally new term entered on the scene – civil society (*al-mujtama' al-madani*)," and along with it "a constellation of concepts that radically altered the available tools of political discourse, opening up unforeseen possibilities for political thought and action." Browsers demonstrated that what civil society means is highly contested among Arab intellectuals, yet, as she also pointed out, the term has been highly contested from the very beginnings of Western intellectual life as well (cf., Alexander, *The Civil Sphere*). In the Arab world, for example, more communal Islamic approaches have been contrasted, favorably and unfavorably, with definitions that emphasize more individualistic and pluralistic understandings of civil society, whether liberal or socialist. Browsers concludes, nonetheless, that "the polarization between advocates of secularism and advocates of Islamicization belies an underlying consensus about at least some of the ideational constellations that construct a liberal public sphere (democracy, civil society, citizenship)" and that "despite the variation among particular conceptions of civil society there is broad agreement that enlarging a democratically engaged public sphere must be a priority for the development of the Arab region" (Browsers, *Democracy and Civil Society*, 209). In the most recently published book-length examination of contemporary Egypt, *Egypt on the Brink*, Tarek Osman finds such intellectual developments paralleled by trends in the nation's popular culture: "Formulating their own definition of Egyptianism" and "depressed by the devastating decline

of Egyptian culture, values, attitudes and behavior," young Egyptians "leapt over the past fifty years (seeing only troubles and failures), and embraced Egypt's liberal experiment of the 1920s, 1930s and 1940s" (Tarek Osman, *Egypt on the Brink: From Nasser to Mubarak* [New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2010, 210]. Osman reports that "the 2000s saw a plethora of films, TV series and novels glorifying and extolling the liberal experiment, especially its tolerant values, and its relaxed *modus vivendi*," and he notes also the "rise of private universities, businessmen associations, chambers of commerce, consumer protection groups and the multitude of independent press and [satellite] TV channels" (Osman, *Egypt on the Brink*, 220).

It represented a remarkable lapse in the mass media reporting on the Arab Spring in general, and on the Egyptian Revolution in particular, that scarcely any mention was made of the Arab intellectual revolution of the preceding decades. This neglect reflects the broader failures of Western commentary to highlight the cultural nature of the Egyptian revolution and of Western social scientists to put meaning at the center of their analysis of revolutions. For singular academic efforts demonstrating the decisive role shifting intellectual traditions play in revolutions, see Bernard Bailyn, *The Ideological Origins of the American Revolution* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1967) and Keith Michael Baker, *Inventing the French Revolution: Essays in French Political Culture in the 18th Century* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1990).

- 65 *USA Today*, "Anti-Mubarak Protest Brings Moment of Truth for US," *USA Today*, 31 January 2011, 8A.
- 66 Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba."
- 67 Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba."
- 68 Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba."
- 69 Essam El-Errian, "What the Muslim Brothers Want," *New York Times*, 10 February 2011, A25. El-Errian is identified by the *New York Times* as a member of the Muslim Brotherhood's "guidance council" in Egypt.
- 70 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7:43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 71 Owen Dorell and Alice Fordham, "Fury Grows in Egypt," *USA Today*,

11 February 2011, 1A.

72 Thomas L. Friedman, "Up with Egypt," *New York Times*, 9 February 2011, A27.

73 Kirkpatrick and Slackman, "In New Role."

74 Kareem Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians."

75 El-Naggar and Slackman, "Egypt's Leader Used Old Tricks."

76 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."

77 Al-Bushra, "Egyptian Revolution."

78 Friedman, "Speakers' Corner."

79 Hamza Hendawi, "Egyptian Protesters Denounce Mubarak; Clash with Riot Police," Associated Press, 25 January 2011, <http://www.aolnews.com/2011/01/25/egyptians-denouncemubarak-clash-with-riot-police> [accessed 7 March 2011].

80 Mohamed ElBaradei, "The Next Step for Egypt's Opposition," *New York Times*, 11 February 2011, A27.

81 El-Naggar and Slackman, "Egypt's Leader Used Old Tricks."

82 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."

83 Jack Shenker, "Mubarak Regime in Crisis as Biggest Anti-government Demonstrations in a Generation Sweep across Egypt," *Guardian*, 26 January 2011.

84 WAAKS (Arabic), 27 January 2011, 12.42 a.m.:

لن تهربنا عصيانكم ولا رصاصاتكم المطاطية ولا رصاصكم
الحى.. كلنا سنموت لتحيا مصر

85 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 5 February 2011, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wkvzYY_Kp7c&feature=relmfu&safety_mode=true&persist_safety_mode=1.

86 Michael Slackman, "A Brittle Leader, Appearing Strong," *New York Times*, 12 February 2011, A1.

87 Mekhennet and Kulish, "With Muslim Brotherhood Set to Join Egypt Protests."

88 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Egypt Protests Continue as Government Resigns," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, <http://warsclerotic.wordpress.com/2011/01/29/egypt-protests-continue-as-government-resigns-nytimes-com> [accessed 20 June 2011].

89 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."

- 90 Kirkpatrick and Slackman, "In New Role."
- 91 Thomas L. Friedman, "Pharaoh Without a Mummy," *New York Times*, 16 February 2011, A25.
- 92 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
- 93 Saad Eddin Ibrahim, "Mubarak's Interests Are Not America's; The Dictator Can't be Trusted," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 8 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704858404576128450511611970.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 94 Marc Champion, "In a Flash, Alexandria Erupts in Mass Jubilee," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 11 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704329104576138353660891850.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 95 Bernardo Valli, "Egitto, Nella Piazza che Grida 'Da qui non ce ne andiamo'," *La Repubblica*, 5 February 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/02/05/news/egitto_nella_piazza_che_grida_da_qui_non_ce_ne_andiamo-12081033 [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 96 Bernardo Valli, "La Beffa Finale del Faraone di Plastica," *La Repubblica*, 11 February 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/02/11/news/beffa_faraone-12321773 [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 97 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 7.43 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/B0C28F6C-8BFB-4786-B183-FFFB488C956E.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 98 Peter Beaumont and Jack Shenker, "A Day of Fury: Cairo in Flames as Cities Become Battlegrounds," *Guardian*, 29 January 2011, 2.
- 99 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Violent Clashes Mark Protests Against Mubarak's Rule."
- 100 Cécile Hennion, "Egypte: Moubarak Sous Oression," *Le Monde*, 29 January 2011, 1.
- 101 Fabio Scuto, "El Baradei, l'Uomo del Destino 'Oggi Nasce un Paese Nuovo'," *La Repubblica*, 1 February 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/02/01/news/baradei_uomo_destino-11904735 [accessed 15 April 2011].
- 102 This distinction can be made only if the civil sphere and the nation-state are made analytically distinct. A common error of "nationalism studies" is to explain cultural identities entirely in terms of varieties of nationalism. But the civil sphere is a relatively independent world of culture and social organization, which has its own discourse

and modes of incorporation, even as enforcement is related to state functions. To suggest that Egyptians were embracing civic as compared to primordial nationalism points to their aspiration to construct a civil sphere that was relatively independent, not only from state coercion but from religious qualifications, ethnicity, regional, and economic statuses as well.

- 103 Here and in later sections, the extracts that have quotation marks are statements by participants; the remainder are quotations from media observations.
- 104 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
- 105 David D. Kirkpatrick and David E. Sanger, "Egypt Officials Seek to Nudge Mubarak Out," *New York Times*, 5 February 2011, A1.
- 106 Kareem Fahim, "Birthplace of Uprising Welcomes Its Success," *New York Times*, 12 February 2011, A9.
- 107 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."
- 108 Al Jazeera (English), "Fresh Anti-government Protests in Egypt," Al Jazeera (English), 26 January 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/01/201112663450547321.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 109 Zeinab Mohamed, Victoria Hazou, David Degner, Firas al-Atraqchi and Joseph Mayton, "The Word on the Street: The Protests This Week in Egypt Against the Mubarak Regime Have Grippd the Country," *Guardian*, 28 January 2011, "G2" 6.
- 110 Ahdaf Soueif, "Protesters Reclaim the Spirit of Egypt," BBC News, 13 February 2011, <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-12393795> [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 111 Kareem Fahim and Mona El-Naggar, "Emotions of a Reluctant Hero Inject New Life Into the Protest Movement," *New York Times*, 9 February 2011, A14.
- 112 Behind these near-term collective representations, the political culture of the movement's secular and religious leaders – in Gramsci's terms, the movement's "organic" and "high" intellectuals – remains to be further explored. If one looked more deeply into shifting Islamic themes about freedom, justice, and community, one would undoubtedly find hyphenations between the religious and secular, recalling the kinds of amalgamations that were made, centuries ago, between Christianity and secular political ideologies

during the English and American revolutions. For the American case, see Ruth Bloch, *Visionary Republic: Millennial Themes in American Thought, 1756–1800* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1985) and Nathan C. Hatch, *The Sacred Cause of Liberty* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1977); for the British, see Michael Walzer, *The Revolution of the Saints* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1965).

- 113 See Ron Eyerman and Andrew Jameson, *Social Movements: A Cognitive Approach* (London: Polity, 1991) and Ron Eyerman, "Performing Opposition or, How Social Movements Move," in Jeffrey C. Alexander, Bernhard Giesen and Jason Mast (eds), *Social Performance: Symbolic Action, Cultural Pragmatics, and Ritual* (New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 193–216.
- 114 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Protest's Old Guard Falls in Behind the Young," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, A1.
- 115 Kirkpatrick, "Protest's Old Guard".
- 116 Ian Black, "Middle East: Protest Plans: Leaflets Being Circulated in Cairo Give Blueprint for Mass Action," *Guardian*, 28 January 2011, 26.
- 117 Kareem Fahim, "Hopes of Egyptians."
- 118 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Wired, Educated and Shrewd, Young Egyptians Guide Revolt," *New York Times*, 10 February 2011, 1.
- 119 For the long political-cum-conceptual history of new class ideas, see Lawrence Peter King and Iván Szelenyi, *Theories of the New Class: Intellectuals and Power* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2004).
- 120 For the idea that a "culture of critical discourse" is specific to the new class, see Alvin W. Gouldner, *The Future of Intellectuals and the Rise of the New Class* (New York, NY: Seabury, 1979).
- 121 In analyses of the Arab Spring as it was unfolding, Farhad Khosrokhavar tellingly employed the new class trope in a less economic manner (see Farhad Khosrokhavar, "Fin des Dictatures au Proche et Moyen-Orient? *Le Monde* (online), 17 January 2011, http://www.lemonde.fr/idees/article/2011/01/17/fin-des-dictatures-au-proche-et-moyen-orient_1466683_3232.html [accessed 12 June 2011]; Farhad Khosrokhavar, "Les Neuf Piliers de la Révolution Arabe, *Le Nouvel Observateur*, 10–16 February 2011, 94–5). Writing of "the emergence of the new middle classes" as providing "political

and moral direction," his usage is close to the concept of carrier group deployed here. Understanding revolutionary leadership as a carrier group, rather than as a representative of a class, clarifies that the leadership represents not only its own interest, or even interests per se, but broader cultural and political aspirations that are not only specific to a particular time and place but extend to groups other than their own. For an enduring study of the relation between Puritan clergy and English gentry, which together constituted the carrier group for the English Revolution, see Walzer, *The Revolution of the Saints*.

122 David D. Kirkpatrick and David E. Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link."

123 While speaking of the organizers as a group, one should not reify the network that linked people who comprised the revolutionary leadership. At various times from 2005 onward, there were a number of associations with overlapping memberships, and shifting coalitions emerged even during the eighteen days of the revolution itself. In his field notes, for example, Atef Said notes that on "the 30th of January or so, one of the main coalitions was formed" and that "this include[d] many youth organizations who called for the protests on January 25th." It was the Coalition for the Youth of the Revolution, and included "justice and freedom (leftist), the 6th of April (liberally oriented), el Baradie supporters (liberally oriented), Muslim Brotherhood (moderate political Islamist), the youth of the Democratic Front Party (liberally oriented) ... The Coalition had a Facebook page and its press releases were circulated widely" (Atef Said, "On the Communication During the Internet Blackout in Egypt and Generally During the 18 Days of the Egyptian Revolution," Ethnographic Field Notes, unpublished manuscript, 22 April 2011). See also Maryam Ishani, "The Hopeful Network," in Marc Lynch, Susan B. Glasser, and Blake Hounshell (eds), *Revolution in the Arab World* (Washington DC: Foreign Policy, 2011). Yet, if the carrier group was more network than central committee, in the days after the Jasmine revolution in Tunisia a fairly well-organized directing group did form in Egypt, providing the strategic and tactical organization for the 25 January Revolution. In the years to come, debates will undoubtedly flourish about the history and sociology of the groups and interests constituting this revolutionary leadership and their ideologies. Hossam El-Hamalawy ("Egypt's Revolution Has Been Ten Years in the Making," *Guardian*, 2 March 2011, <http://www>.

guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2011/mar/02/egypt-revolution-mubarak-wall-of-fear [accessed 10 June 2011]) and Atef Said (Atef Said, "Uprising in Egypt: America in the Egyptian Revolution," The Immanent Frame [blog], 4 April 2011, <http://blogs.ssrc.org/tif/2011/04/11/america-in-the-egyptian-revolution> [accessed 15 June 2011]) for example, emphasize antecedent political events going back to 2000, and claim that labor activism and "anti-imperialist" (anti-Israeli occupation, anti-American) ideology played significant, even foundational roles. In the present essay, I place more weight on developments that were discontinuous with earlier forms of Egyptian and Middle-Eastern protest: the broadly cross-class, civil-society character of the 25 January movement; the transforming effects of the intellectual revolution in Arab society; the incorporation of non-violence as a tactic; and, more broadly, the emergent properties of civil solidarity as a performative accomplishment.

- 124 For the relation between young Egyptian organizers and the non-violent movement in Serbia that Otpor initiated, and an analysis of the international outreach of CANVAS, the Center for Applied Non-Violent Action and Strategy, that Otpor's founders created in 2003 in Belgrade, see Tina Rosenberg, "Revolution U," in Lynch *et al.*, *Revolution in the Arab World*.
- 125 Ron Nixon, "U.S. Groups Helped Nurture Arab Opposition," *New York Times*, 15 April 2011, A1.
- 126 Words with meanings are merely locutionary, in John L. Austin's terms (John L. Austin, *How to Do Things with Words* [Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2nd edition, 1962]), but actually doing things with words indicates that speech acts go "beyond" meaning to having illocutionary or even perlocutionary effect. Illocutionary suggests the audience takes on a deep understanding of the implications of the speech, perlocutionary that the hearer takes action in response to this understanding. There are, of course, gradients. In China today, free speech is relatively protected inside of private spheres and certain institutional spaces, such as elite universities, but it is increasingly restricted in public spaces. The effect is to allow locutionary but not illocutionary or perlocutionary action – in my terms, to allow scripts to be written but to prevent them from being performed.

- 127 Austin, *How to Do Things with Words*.
- 128 Douglas B. Holt, *How Brands Become Icons: The Principles of Cultural Branding* (Boston, MA: Harvard Business School, 2004).
- 129 Kirkpatrick and Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link."
- 130 Valentin Rauer, "Symbols in Action: Willy Brandt's Kneefall at the Warsaw Memorial," in Alexander *et al.*, *Social Performance*, 257–82.
- 131 Kirkpatrick, "Wired, Educated and Shrewd."
- 132 Kirkpatrick and Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link."
- 133 Kareem Fahim and Mona El-Naggar, "Across Egypt, Protests Direct Fury at Leader," *New York Times*, 26 January 2011, A1.
- 134 Soueif, "Fittingly, It's the Young of the Country."
- 135 Slackman, "In Mideast Activism."
- 136 Robert D. Kaplan, "One Small Revolution," *New York Times*, 23 January 2011, "Week in Review" 11. Kaplan made his name as a neo-conservative political intellectual; he was an enthusiastic supporter of the Bush administration's invasion and occupation of Iraq.
- 137 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Across Egypt."
- 138 Jack Shenker, "Revolt Spreads to Egypt, Violent Clashes on Streets of Cairo," *Guardian*, 26 January 2011, 1.
- 139 Slackman, "Compact Between Egypt and Its Leader Erodes."
- 140 Anthony Shadid and David D. Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt, Opposition Unifies Around Government Critic," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, 1.
- 141 Mohamed *et al.*, "The Word on the Street."
- 142 Shadid, "In the Euphoria of the Crowd."
- 143 Jim Michaels, "Tech-savvy Youths Led the Way in Egypt Protests; And They Want Seat at the Table in Negotiations," *USA Today*, 7 February 2011, 2A.
- 144 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Across Egypt."
- 145 Mekhennet and Kulish, "With Muslim Brotherhood."
- 146 Robert F. Worth, "On Al Jazeera, a Revolution Televised Despite Hurdles," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A11.
- 147 Shenker, "Revolt Spreads to Egypt."
- 148 *La Repubblica*, "'Mubarak Vattene. Basta Dittatura,' La Protesta degli

- Egiziani a Roma," *La Repubblica*, 31 January 2011, http://roma.repubblica.it/cronaca/2011/01/31/news/mubarak_vattene_basta_dittatura_la_protesta_degli_egiziani_a_roma-11893136 [accessed 15 April 2011]. This message was written on the signs of Egyptian protestors in Rome.
- 149 *Guardian*, "Front: Egypt: How the Events Unfolded," *Guardian*, 29 January 2011, 2.
 - 150 Peter Beaumont and Jack Shenker, "Front: Egypt: A Day of Fury: Cairo in Flames as Cities Become Battlegrounds," *Guardian*, 29 January 2011, 2.
 - 151 Harriet A. Sherwood, Angelique Chrisafis, Martin Chulov and Hazem Balousha, "Fall of Mubarak: Hope and Fear, How the Arab World Reacted," *Guardian*, 12 February 2011, 4; Gerald Seib, "Now Dawning: The Next Era of Middle East History," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 31 January 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704254304576116110110596324.html> [accessed 20 June 2011]; John Bussey, "How to Handle Employee Activism: Google Tiptoes Around Cairo's Hero," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 10 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704132204576136323073589858.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
 - 152 Dorell and Fordham, "Fury Grows in Egypt."
 - 153 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
 - 154 Levinson and Dagher, "Rallies Fan Out;" cf., *Guardian*, "Front: Egypt."
 - 155 Robert Tait, "Front: Egypt: 28 Hours in the Dark Heart of Egypt's Torture Machine," *Guardian*, 10 February 2011, 4.
 - 156 Fouad Ajami, "Egypt's 'Heroes With No Names'; We Must Remember that Mohamed Atta and Ayman Zawahiri Were Bred in the Tyranny of Hosni Mubarak," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 12 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704132204576136442019920256.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
 - 157 *New York Times*, 4 February 2011, A12.
 - 158 Kirkpatrick, "Egyptians Defiant."
 - 159 Mohamed *et al.*, "The Word on the Street."
 - 160 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Across Egypt."
 - 161 El-Naggar and Slackman, "Egypt's Leader Used Old Tricks."
 - 162 Marc Landler, "Obama Cautions Embattled Egyptian Ally Against Violent Repression," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A1.

- 163 Neil MacFarquhar, "Egypt's Respected Military Is Seen as Pivotal in What Happens Next," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A13.
- 164 Nicholas Kulish and Souad Mekhennet, "In Alexandria, Protesters Win After a Day of Fierce Fighting with Riot Police," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A12.
- 165 Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba."
- 166 Michael Slackman, "Omar Suleiman: A Choice Likely to Please the Military, not the Crowds," *New York Times*, 30 January 2011, A10. The quotation is from Mahmoud Shokry, former ambassador to Syria and personal friend of Omar Suleiman, on Mr. Suleiman's appointment as vice-president.
- 167 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
- 168 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
- 169 Ahdaf Soueif, "Egypt: 'For Everyone Here, There's No Turning Back,'" *Guardian*, 2 February 2011, 1.
- 170 Joshua Yaffa, "Downloading the Uprising; Can Technology's Tools Liberate Those Living Under Political Repression?" *Wall Street Journal* (online), 4 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704150104576122751785029870.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 171 Anthony Shadid, "Discontented Within Egypt Face Power of Old Elites," *New York Times*, 5 February 2011, A7.
- 172 Owen Dorell, "Protests Have Economic Ripple Effects; Movement Gets Mixed Reviews from Those Who Aren't Taking Part as Tourism has Disappeared," *USA Today*, 7 February 2011, 4A.
- 173 Ian Black, "Egypt: Analysis. Constitution at the Heart of Change in Egypt," *Guardian*, 8 February 2011, 22.
- 174 Anthony Shadid, "Egypt's Leaders Seek to Project Air of Normalcy," *New York Times*, 8 February 2011, A1.
- 175 Matt Bradley, Christopher Rhoads and Shereen El Gazzar, "Cairo Demonstrators Dig In," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 8 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704364004576131560748488384.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 176 *New York Times*, "Mr. Suleiman's Empty Promises," *New York Times*, 9 February 2011, A26.
- 177 Jack Shenker, "Teargas and Baton Charges Sweep Protesters Off Cairo's Streets," *Guardian*, 26 January 2011, 22.

-
- 178 Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak's Grip Is Shaken."
- 179 *New York Times*, "Beyond Mubarak," *New York Times*, 2 February 2011, A22.
- 180 Jack Shenker, Peter Beaumont, Ian Black, and Chris McGreal, "Egypt: Power to the People: Mubarak Finally Bows to the Inevitable," *Guardian*, 2 February 2011, 1.
- 181 Kareem Fahim and Mona El-Naggar, "Some Fear a Street Movement's Leaderless Status May Become a Liability," *New York Times*, 4 February 2011, A7.
- 182 *Le Monde*, "Le Régime Moubarak Contre-attaque," *Le Monde*, 4 February 2011, 1.
- 183 Valli, "Egitto, Nella Piazza che Grida."
- 184 Alessandra Stanley, "As Crisis Plays Out Live on TV, Commentators Hurl Brickbats at One Another," *New York Times*, 5 February 2011, A7.
- 185 *La Repubblica*, "Manifestanti Ancora in Piazza al Cairo Usa Premono per Cambiamento," *La Repubblica*, 5 February 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/02/05/news/sostituiti_vertici_partito_mubarak_lascia-12100571 [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 186 David Sanger, "As Mubarak Digs In, Complications for U.S. Policy," *New York Times*, 6 February 2011, A12.
- 187 Shadid, "Egypt's Leaders."
- 188 Kirkpatrick, "As Egypt Protest Swells."
- 189 Valli, "La Beffa Finale."
- 190 Mona El-Naggar, "The Legacy of 18 Days in Tahrir Square," *New York Times*, 20 February 2011, "Week in Review" 4.
- 191 Al Jazeera (English), "Egypt Protesters Clash with Police," Al Jazeera (English), 25 January 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/01/201112511362207742.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 192 Friedman, "Speakers' Corner."
- 193 Anthony Shadid, "Yearning for Respect, Arabs Find a Voice," *New York Times*, 30 January 2011, A10.
- 194 Niccolo Machiavelli, *The Discourses*, in *The Essential Writings of Niccolo Machiavelli*, translated and edited by Peter Constantine (New York, NY: Modern Library, 2007 [1531]), Bk I: 25.

- 195 Anthony Shadid, "Egypt Officials Widen Crackdown; US in Talks for Mubarak to Quit," *New York Times*, 4 February 2011, A1.
- 196 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 197 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 198 Dorell, "Protests Have Economic Ripple Effects."
- 199 Benjamin Barthe, "A Zamalek, la Bourgeoisie du Caire Défend ses Biens et Prend ses Distance avec le Régime," *Le Monde*, 1 February 2011, 6.
- 200 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 201 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 202 Dorell, "Protests Have Economic Ripple Effects."
- 203 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 204 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 205 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt." The director's first name is misspelled in the *New York Times* article. It should be Selma al-Tarzi, not Salma.
- 206 Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan, or The Matter, Forme, & Power of a Common-wealth Ecclesiasticall and Civill*, edited by Richard Tuck (2nd edition, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 1996[1651]), 84.
- 207 *La Repubblica*, "Scontri e Morti."
- 208 Al Jazeera (English), "Timeline: Egypt's Revolution," Al Jazeera (English), 14 February 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/01/201112515334871490.html> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 209 Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Orders Crackdown."
- 210 Kirkpatrick, "Egyptians Defiant."
- 211 Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Orders Crackdown."
- 212 Victor Turner, *The Ritual Process* (Chicago, IL: Aldine, 1969). Jill Dolan connects Turner's ideas to contemporary performance theory and to the radical political imagination in her book, *Jill Dolan, Utopia in Performance: Finding Hope at the Theater* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 2005).
- 213 Mohamed ElBaradei, "Quotation of the Day," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, A2.
- 214 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."

-
- 215 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."
- 216 Mohamed et al., "The Word on the Street."
- 217 Beaumont and Shenker, "Front: Egypt."
- 218 Rampoldi, "La Rivolta che Cambia la Storia Araba."
- 219 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
- 220 Shadid, "Seizing Control of Their Lives."
- 221 Shadid, "Yearning for Respect."
- 222 *USA Today*, "Anti-Mubarak Protest."
- 223 *Guardian*, "Egypt: Beyond Mubarak," *Guardian*, 2 February 2011, 32.
- 224 Shadid, "In the Euphoria of the Crowd."
- 225 *New York Times*, "From Sadat to Mubarak: A Reminiscence, and a Prayer," *New York Times*, 3 February 2011, <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/02/03/opinion/lweb03cairo.html> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 226 Cécile Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne; Venus en Famille, les Manifestants ont Donné à la Place Tahrir un Air de Kermesse." *Le Monde*, 3 February 2011, 5.
- 227 David Feith, "Democracy's Tribune on the Arab Awakening," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 4 February 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704150104576122882240386172.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 228 Jack Shenker and Mustafa Khalili, "Day of No Departure: Cairo's Biggest Turnout Yet, but Mubarak Clings On," *Guardian*, 5 February 2011, 1.
- 229 Anthony Shadid, "At Night in Tahrir Square, Cairo Protest Gives Way to Poetry and Performances," *New York Times*, 7 February 2011, A9.
- 230 Friedman, "Speakers' Corner."
- 231 Mimi Hall and Kevin Johnson, "White House Pushes for 'genuine transition'; 'Fast-changing situation' in Egypt Difficult to Track," *USA Today*, 11 February 2011, 1A.
- 232 *New York Times*, "Egypt's Moment," *New York Times*, 12 February 2011, A20.
- 233 Anthony Shadid, "After Tahrir, Uncharted Ground," *New York Times*, 12 February 2011, A1.
- 234 Nicholas D. Kristoff, "Exhilarated by the Hope in Cairo," *New York Times*, 1 February 2011, A27.

- 235 Shadid, "At Night in Tahrir Square."
- 236 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."
- 237 Shadid, "At Night in Tahrir Square."
- 238 Matt Bradley, "Rioters Jolt Egyptian Regime," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 25 January 2011, <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704698004576104112320465414.html> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 239 Soueif, "Fittingly, It's the Young of the Country."
- 240 Shadid, "At Night in Tahrir Square."
- 241 Barthe and Hennion, "La Révolte Egyptienne."
- 242 Al Jazeera (English), "Tahrir: the Epicenter of the Revolution," Al Jazeera (English), 7 February 2011, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SeTzu9aK3xs> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 243 Gregg Carlstrom, "Community Amid Egypt's Chaos," Al Jazeera (English), 7 February 2011, <http://english.aljazeera.net/news/middleeast/2011/02/201127162644461244.html> [accessed 7 March 2011].
- 244 Cécile Hennion, "Sur la Place Tahrir, Epicentre de la Révolte Egyptienne," *Le Monde*, 1 February 2011, 6.
- 245 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "In Egypt."
- 246 Shadid, "In the Euphoria of the Crowd."
- 247 El-Naggar, "The Legacy." El-Naggar refers here to an encounter two weeks earlier.
- 248 Anthony Shadid, "Mubarak Won't Run Again, But Stays; Obama urges a Faster Shift of Power," *New York Times*, 2 February 2011, A1.
- 249 Shadid, "Discontented Within Egypt."
- 250 Friedman, "Speakers' Corner."
- 251 The violence concentrated on 2 February but carried into the next day (Shadid, "Street Battle Over the Arab Future.")
- 252 C. McGreal, "Front: Egypt in Crisis: 'Mubarak is still here, but there's been a revolution in our minds'," *Guardian*, 6 February 2011, 4.
- 253 Theodore May, "Protesters Stand Fast in Cairo's Tahrir Square," *USA Today*, 8 February 2011, 4A.
- 254 Shadid, "Egypt Officials Widen Crackdown."
- 255 Ruba Assaf, "Thugs Confront Egyptian Protesters," Al Jazeera (Arabic)

(Read by Hatem Ghandir), 4 February 2011, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5zX8lIGBDZ4&feature=relmfu> [accessed 10 June 2011].

- 256 Shadid, "Egypt's Leaders."
- 257 Kirkpatrick, "As Egypt Protest Swells."
- 258 WAKS, 8 February 2011. David D. Kirkpatrick, "Google Executive Who Was Jailed Said He Was Part of Online Campaign in Egypt," *New York Times*, 8 February 2011, A10. Translated from the Arabic by the *New York Times*.
- 259 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Emotions of a Reluctant Hero."
- 260 Kirkpatrick, "Google Executive."
- 261 Fahim and El-Naggar, "Emotions of a Reluctant Hero."
- 262 Hosni Mubarak, "I will not ... accept to hear foreign dictations," *Washington Post* (online), 10 February 2011, <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2011/02/10/AR2011021005290.html> [accessed 10 June 2011].
- 263 Shadid and Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Won't Quit."
- 264 David D. Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Out," *New York Times*, 12 February 2011, 1.
- 265 Ajami, "Egypt's 'Heroes With No Names'."
- 266 Ahdaf Soueif, "Fall of Mubarak: 'Look at the streets of Egypt ... this is what hope looks like'," *Guardian*, 12 February 2011, 2.
- 267 Shadid, "After Tahrir."
- 268 Fahim, "Birthplace of Uprising Welcomes Its Success."
- 269 *Wall Street Journal*, "Celebrations Follow Resignation in Egypt," *Wall Street Journal* (online), 12 February 2011, <http://blogs.wsj.com/photojournal/2011/02/11/celebrations-follow-resignation-in-egypt/> [accessed 20 June 2011].
- 270 Shadid, "After Tahrir."
- 271 Kirkpatrick and Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link."
- 272 Worth, "On Al Jazeera."
- 273 Al-Bushra, "Egyptian Revolution."
- 274 Worth, "On Al Jazeera."
- 275 Worth, "On Al Jazeera;" Marc Lynch, "Beyond the Arab Street: Iraq and the Arab Public Sphere," *Politics and Society* 31: 1 (2003): 55–91.

Of course, mass media of communication are not the only means for dissenting discourse and drama to be displayed and distributed. Under Nazi and communist totalitarianism, underground ("samizdat") mimeographed and printed material circulated secretly alongside word of mouth "whispering" campaigns. In ethnographic field notes from his stay in Cairo during the latter days of the revolution, Atef Said reports that word of mouth communication was a significant response to the government's efforts at blocking digital communication: "Activists who left for their homes talked to their neighbors. Also, activists used land lines during this period, at night, to call their friends and make sure things are ok or send messages about what to do tomorrow." Said's notes also mention that, although talking to taxi drivers "is an old method," they "knew stories and they tell others stories" (Said, "On the Communication").

- 276 Said's field notes make clear that even when the regime's effort to blackout digital communication was its most intense level – during the two-day period 28–9 January – the attempt was never more than partially successful: "During these days both Facebook and Twitter were not working properly [but] bloggers and activists in Twitter distributed information about opening Facebook by proxy or twitter ... On 29th [January] cell-phones were back to work ... On January 30th, Google provided voice your tweet service to Egypt ... On Feb. 2nd, internet was back. During all this time, [while] al-jazeera Arabic was often subjected to disarranging [sic] ... Egyptians [with] a particular satellite could watch [or follow it] via the internet" (Said, "On the Communication").
- 277 Brian Stelter, "From Afar, News about Egypt." *New York Times*, 14 February 2011, B4.
- 278 Jennifer Preston, "While Facebook Plays a Star Role in the Revolts, Its Executives Stay Offstage," *New York Times*, 15 February 2011, 10.
- 279 Preston, "While Facebook Plays a Star Role."
- 280 Christine Hauser, "New Service Lets Voices from Egypt Be Heard," *New York Times*, 2 February 2011, A14.
- 281 Mansoura Ez-Eldin, "Date with a Revolution," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, A19.
- 282 Keying on the word "Mubarak," a Stanford computer studies graduate student, Rio Akasaka, constructed a real-time "vimeo" (shared video) of worldwide social network activity from 7 to 14

February 2011. Among the 455,840 tweets whose motion he mapped, by far the highest concentration was in North America and Europe, with significant activity as well in the Middle East (see <http://vimeo.com/20233225>). A similar pattern of global social networking activity is revealed in Akasaka's vimeo collection of 123,000 tweets during the final minutes of Mubarak's 10 February speech, when he announced he would not resign (see <http://vimeo.com/19824159>). As this tweet networking map indicates, the transnational surround of Egypt's revolution very much included a regional force of more immediately contiguous countries, often referred to as the Arab public sphere (Lynch, "Beyond the Arab Street"). Culturally and politically, events in Egypt have for centuries been intertwined with such a broader Arab connection, and they are ever more closely connected in the digitalized social media world of today. The narrative of national decline and resurrection, for example, was directed as much to the restoration of Egypt's once leading place in the Arab world as it was to Egypt's place in "civilization" as such. And vice versa: Egypt's cultural and political institutions have been matters of great import to the Arab public sphere. Al Jazeera's dense and enthusiastic coverage of the Egyptian revolution was energized by these regional bonds even as it was regulated by the standards of independent journalism and global civil society.

- 283 The ideal of a global civil sphere captures something terribly significant about contemporary social realities, but it also fundamentally distorts them in a wish-fulfilling way (Jeffrey C. Alexander, "Globalization as Collective Representation: The New Dream of a Cosmopolitan Civil Sphere," in Ino Rossi (ed.), *Frontiers Of Globalization Research: Theoretical And Methodological Approaches* [New York, NY: Springer, 2007], 371–82). Some strands of public opinion do circulate globally, from popular and high culture to moral opinions about current events, but this collective will formation hardly possesses the wide reach of public opinion inside the civil spheres of democratic nation states. Nor can global public opinion, even in its necessarily fragmented form, be implemented by political power acting in its name. The global community has no state, no electoral process, no political party competition, and no monopoly on violence – all basic institutional prerequisites for regulating social processes on behalf of civil power.

- 284 Hillary Rodham Clinton, "Remarks with Spanish Foreign Minister

Trinidad Jimenez After Their Meeting," 25 January 2011, Washington, DC, <http://www.state.gov/secretary/rm/2011/01/155280.htm>, [accessed 10 June 2011].

- 285 If China's economic rise is eventually accompanied by commensurate military power – as modern Japan and Germany's postwar economic revivals were not – it may aggressively challenge Western civil definitions of "global." If China itself undergoes a democratic transition, binding its state to domestic civil power, it could have quite the opposite effect, allowing the civil definition of "global" to become more truly global in a substantive sense. This would be especially true if a new China were aligned with democracies in Japan and Korea. The glaring weakness of such realist geopolitical treatises as Paul Kennedy, *The Rise and Fall of the Great Powers* (New York, NY: Random House, 1987) or Samuel Huntington, *The Clash of Civilizations* (New York, NY: Simon & Schuster, 1996) is their failure to consider the potential affect on state interest and military power of such civil sphere binding or the lack thereof. This issue was forcefully articulated by an opinion piece in *Le Monde*: "The events in Egypt and Tunisia pose an important question to Western democracies: Should they practice public diplomacy committing themselves to 'universal' values? In sum, should they keep the flag of civil liberties and human rights in their pocket, pull it out halfway or deploy it permanently? ... The demonstrators in Cairo and Tunis send a message to the school of realist diplomacy: they must call a dictator a dictator, and loudly" (*Le Monde*, "Editorial; Il Faut Appeler un Dictateur un Dictateur," *Le Monde*, 2 February 2011, 1). While this is a forceful normative statement, however, the ideals of a global civil sphere are not universally applied and so-called realist considerations often overrule. Not every dictator is called a dictator. Neither is it the case that the internal construction of a civil society will make it behave externally in a peaceful manner. The discourse of civil society is binary and splitting, and it often sustains aggression outside the nation state even as it promotes pacific democracy at home. A post-dictatorship Egypt could be violently anti-Zionist, for example.
- 286 For the role of metaphor in politics, see Eric Ringmar, "The Power of Metaphor: Consent, Dissent & Revolution," in R. Mole (ed.), *Discursive Constructions of Identity in European Politics* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007); for the role of performance

- in the international relations between states, see Eric Ringmar, "Performing International Relations: Two East Asian Alternatives to the Westphalian Order," *International Organization* 66: 2 (2012).
- 287 Nicholas D. Kristoff, "Militants, Women and Tahrir Square," *New York Times*, 6 February 2011, "Week in Review" 8.
- 288 *New York Times*, "Beyond Mubarak."
- 289 Kristoff, "Militants, Women and Tahrir Square."
- 290 Kristoff, "Militants, Women and Tahrir Square."
- 291 Caroline Fourest, "Sans Détour; Le Mur du Caire Doit Iomber," *Le Monde*, 5 February 2011, 20.
- 292 Steven Laurence Kaplan, "De 1789 à L'Intifada Egyptienne, le Pain," *Le Monde*, 8 February 2011, 19.
- 293 Lucio Caracciolo, "L'Occasione che Perderemo," *La Repubblica*, 31 January 2011, http://www.repubblica.it/esteri/2011/01/31/news/occasione_egitto-11862368 [accessed 22 April 2011].
- 294 There was variation in the speed with which media resolved the ambiguity between "1979" and "1989." In the United States, the *New York Times* moved more quickly than more conservative papers such as the *Wall Street Journal* and *USA Today*. In Europe, while the *Guardian* moved much more quickly than either *Le Monde* or *La Repubblica*, this was not because of ideological differences but because of the greater continental fear of North African instability increasing immigration. As for Al Jazeera, the news agency did not manifest ambivalence in the first place.
- 295 Lionel Beehner, "In Egypt, 'Islamist' Fears Overblown," *USA Today*, 1 February 2011, 7A.
- 296 *USA Today*, "Rumblings abroad test American ideals," *USA Today*, 27 January 2011, 8A.
- 297 The extraordinary consensus among these otherwise widely divergent media in their reporting of the Egyptian revolution – all of which aligned itself with the democratic aspirations of the revolutionary protagonists in Egypt – provides an operational definition of "global civil sphere." The definition of "global" is as much normative as real. At the time of this writing, the Chinese government has formally designated the Egyptian Revolution as a "sensitive subject" to which references may not be publicly made.
- 298 While the tone of Al Jazeera (Arabic) was often more overtly critical

- than the *New York Times*’, and frequently more passionate and emotional, it contrasted less with the tone of television coverage in American and Europe. In its Arabic broadcasts, Al Jazeera also often intermingled reportage with overt “editorial” opinion, a practice more typical in European than American newspapers.
- 299 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 11:59 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/35AFA009-4090-41FD-9C73-9A703FB54E12.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 300 Al Jazeera (Arabic), 25 January 2011, 11:59 a.m., <http://www.aljazeera.net/NR/exeres/35AFA009-4090-41FD-9C73-9A703FB54E12.htm> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 301 Jack Shenker, “Egypt: Journalist’s Detention: Bloody and Bruised in the Back of a Truck, Destination Unknown.” *Guardian*, 27 January 2011, 18.
- 302 For contemporary accounts of the Egyptian governments efforts to repress journalists during the 25 January Revolution, see Ashraf Khalil, “February 3: Sword vs. Pen”, in Lynch *et al.*, *Revolution in the Arab World*, and Hugh Miles, “The Al Jazeera Effect”, in Lynch *et al.*, *Revolution in the Arab World*.
- 303 Kirkpatrick, “Mubarak’s Grip Is Shaken.”
- 304 Beaumont and Shenker, “Front: Egypt.”
- 305 *Guardian*, “Front: Egypt”.
- 306 Beaumont and Shenker, “Front: Egypt.”
- 307 Jack Shenker and Ian Black, “Egypt: Change is Coming, Says ElBaradei as US Calls for ‘orderly transition’,” *Guardian*, 31 January 2011, 1.
- 308 Soueif, “Egypt.”
- 309 Julian Borger and Jack Shenker, “Egypt: Day of Rumour and Sky-high Expectations Ends in Anger and Confusion,” *Guardian*, 11 February 2011, 4.
- 310 Dorell and Fordham, “Fury Grows in Egypt.”
- 311 David E. Sanger, “When Armies Decide,” *New York Times*, 20 February 2011, “Week in Review” 1.
- 312 For example: “To the Editor: While al Jazeera may have a bias toward the long-suffering downtrodden of the Arab world, its highly professional reporting is a breath of fresh air, representing journalism at its finest. It brings transparency to a part of the world that has

been burdened with far more than its share of autocratic regimes living off the backs of the poor." Tom Miller, "In the Mideast, Days of Tumult," *New York Times*, 29 January 2011, A22; "To the Editor: Why do the people of Egypt have to place themselves in danger of being shot and tear-gassed by the riot police before the United States realizes that it has a 'moral responsibility to stand with those who have the courage to oppose authoritarian rulers' (editorial, Jan. 29)? The United States government has been aware of the nature of President Hosni Mubarak's regime for decades and has sustained it through generous foreign aid, but for whose 'national security concerns'? America's or Israel's? It's time to come down off the fence and stand up for justice. What's what Americans claim they are good at, and now is the time to prove it, across the Middle East." Ibrahim Hewitt, "Sorting Out the Uprising in Egypt," *New York Times*, 1 February 2011, A26.

- 313 Mark Landler, "Obama Cautions Embattled Egyptian Ally."
- 314 Mark Landler, "Clinton Calls for 'Orderly Transition' to Greater Freedom in Egypt," *New York Times*, 31 January 2011, A6.
- 315 Judy Dempsey, "Key European Leaders Urge Restraint in Cairo," *New York Times*, 30 January 2011, <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/01/31/world/europe/31europe.html> [accessed 12 June 2011].
- 316 M. Landler and A. Lehren, "State's Secrets; Cables Show US Tack on Egypt: Public Support, Private Pressure," *New York Times*, 28 January 2011, A1."
- 317 Kirkpatrick and Sanger, "A Tunisian-Egyptian Link."
- 318 Kirkpatrick, "Mubarak Out."
- 319 Ben Zimmer, "How the War of Words Was Won." *New York Times*, 13 February 2011, "Week in Review" 4.
- 320 Kirkpatrick, "Egyptians Defiant."
- 321 Mona El-Naggar, "Egypt to End the Ubiquity of Mubarak," *New York Times*, 22 April 2011, A8.