"Notes." *Figurations and Sensations of the Unseen in Judaism, Christianity and Islam: Contested Desires*. Ed. Birgit Meyer and Terje Stordalen. London: Bloomsbury Methuen Drama, 2016. 283–294. *Bloomsbury Collections*. Web. 26 Apr. 2023. <<http://dx.doi.org/10.5040/9781350078666.0027>>.

Downloaded from Bloomsbury Collections, www.bloomsburycollections.com, 26 April 2023, 09:04 UTC.

Copyright © Birgit Meyer, Terje Stordalen and Contributors. This Work is licensed under the Creative Commons License. 2019. You may share this work for non-commercial purposes only, provided you give attribution to the copyright holder and the publisher, and provide a link to the Creative Commons licence.

Notes

Introduction

- 1 In this respect our volume differs from the volume *Das Bild Gottes in Judentum, Christentum und Islam* (2009), whose editors Hesslinger and Leuschner frame the question of the representability of God in a normative, theological manner (2009: 10–11).
- 2 See also the notable work of art historians working on Christian images and Christian stances towards images, as Gottfried Boehm, Hans Belting, David Freedberg, Joseph Körner and Christiane Kruse (all featuring in the chapter by Meyer), and the important engagement on the part of scholars in religious studies with art history in the volume by Luiselli, Mohn and Gripentrog (2013).

Chapter 1

- 1 Experts now agree that ancient Israel certainly did not avoid all use of images; see Uehlinger in this volume and also the useful overview in Mathys (2013). Still, many biblical texts (which are not necessarily representative of all ‘ancient Israel’) do convey a concern about iconic representations of the deity.
- 2 For further information about different ways of counting and recognizing this command in different Jewish and Biblical traditions, see Yvonne Sherwood in this volume, p. 64. Unless explicitly noted, biblical citations are taken from the New Revised Standard Version of the English Bible.
- 3 This distinction between a de facto, tolerant aniconism and a later intolerant and programmatic iconoclasm is made for instance by Mettinger 2006: 273–6, 289–91. Mettinger was one of the leading voices in a recent exploration of aniconic religion in ancient Western Asia, cf. Mettinger 1995.
- 4 Adding to the passages from Deuteronomy 4 and 5 cited above, see for instance Deut. 5.8; 7.5, 25; 9.12, 16; 12.3; 27.15; 29.17; 32.21.
- 5 For example, Deut. 10.8; 12.12; 16.11, 16; 18.7; 19.17; 26.5–13; 27.7; 29.10–14; 31.11.
- 6 Scholarship concerning the sources is deeply divided, as illustrated in these two examples: DeVries (2003) speaks without hesitation about the sources of the story and implies that these may be old. (The Greek text has more references to sources available for the redactor, and DeVries takes the Greek as the older text.) Van Seters (1997) argues that all text is contemporary with the deuteronomists, which to him means just before the fall of Jerusalem in 586 BCE. I tend to date the DtrH later than Van Seters does, and so I am inclined to believe there were, in fact, sources documenting details of the Temple that fell to the Babylonians. I do agree with Van Seters, though, that these sources probably dated to the period, just before the fall of the Temple. However, all this is very complex and need not be definitively decided for the current purpose.
- 7 See Exod. 24.16; 40.35; Num. 9.17–18.22; 10.12; 14.14, 2 Sam. 22.12; Ps. 31.20; Isa. 4.6, and so on.

- 8 The Greek of v. 13 makes a point out of the contrast between light and darkness: 'A sun hath Yahweh established in the heavens, but he hath purposed to dwell in thick darkness' (cf. DeVries 2003: 114; Sweeney 2007: 132).
- 9 As the reader will realize, this is a rendition only of the most basic insights in Rancière, whose main interest lies in how aesthetics in a wide sense is bound up with politics. His 'aesthetic regime of art' denotes one specific configuration of art and politics: the (Western) ways of conceiving, understanding and seeing art. This regime emerged in the nineteenth century and '[...] simultaneously establishes the autonomy of art and the identity of its forms with the forms that life uses to shape itself' (Rancière 2004: 23). In the world of the Bible, art had not established its own domain, so much of this reflection would be anachronistic for our purpose. However, one insight in Rancière's reasoning still applies, namely that societies establish certain distributions of the sensible, and these contribute to (and reflect) given social orders (cf. Rancière 2004: 18–19, etc.). This is the point I rely on here.

Chapter 2

- 1 Both '*taswir*' and '*surat*' can correspond to the English designation 'picture', but may have differing connotations in different times and places. '*Taswir*' can refer to a picture or representation in general, and thus also to explication, as in the hermeneutical interpretation of the Qur'an, also called *taswir*. '*Surat*' means 'chapter' in Arabic (as in, a section of the Qur'an), but can also mean an impression or image.
- 2 Although often translated as religion, '*al-din*' might be better conveyed as way of life (Ahmed 2015: 187–8).

Chapter 3

- 1 In his excellent chapter in this volume, Terje Stordalen asks how the deuteronomists could have lived out their aniconic convictions 'in real life', given that they did not live in a cultural vacuum. The same question applies to God.
- 2 An allusion to Gotthold Lessing's taxation metaphor distinguishing between the 'gross' of scripture (gross, sometimes, in both senses) and the 'net'. In Lessing's view, the pure, net, meaning of the Bible was what should be kept. See Lessing 2005: 123.
- 3 To nuance this a little further, I should add that, depending on the geographical location, Protestantism or Catholicism also became a mirror of Judaism and Islam.
- 4 'To moloch' has been variously interpreted as the proper name of a god, as the term for a particular kind of fire sacrifice, and as the reference to a king. See for example Smelik 1995. Even if Moloch were finally to be exposed as an accident of misreading, it is way too late in the day to demystify and eradicate the old divinity. Like the golden calf, Moloch has a vibrant modern life well beyond the reach of the Bible and the protests of biblical scholars (for example in the work of Karl Marx, Allen Ginsburg and Friedrich Nietzsche). Biblical scholars do not have the power to kill.
- 5 According to traditional Christian dramas of supersession, the Old Testament is the shadow cast by the sun of Jesus, who comes first (even though historically he comes later). Similarly, here, the M-God is the shadow who came first, who was buried, and who rose and became stronger than the body, precisely because he had no fleshy form.

Chapter 4

- 1 Thanks to Ulrike Brunotte, Pooyan Tamimi Arab, Jeroen Beets, Christiane Kruse, Wendy Shaw, Terje Stordalen, Christoph Uehlinger and, as always, Jojada Verrips for their critical and constructive comments and superb suggestions. The work on this project is situated in the research programme Religious Matters in an Entangled World (www.religiousmatters.nl), generously sponsored by the Netherlands Foundation for Scientific Research (NWO) and the Royal Netherlands Academy for Arts and Sciences.
- 2 Through my anthropological research on local appropriations of missionary Protestantism in Ghana, I encountered the limits of what I took to be characteristic of this strand of Christianity as well as of my scholarly approach to religion at large. This prompted me to deploy an alternative, material approach which takes the body, sensations, objects, images and rituals seriously as authorized harbingers that convey to believers a sense of divine presence, making God real for them (e.g. Meyer 2012). Actually, my inclination to opt for a material approach to religion was grounded in a deep puzzlement about how to find a conceptual space to accommodate the explicit and deliberate human engagement in 'doing' religion and effecting a genesis of divine presence, which I encountered in my research among Protestants and Pentecostals in Ghana.
- 3 Notwithstanding notable exceptions, conceptually ambitious approaches to visual culture in the field of religious studies are still scarce. In resonance with emergent alternative approaches to the making and use of images and their aesthetic effects (Morgan 2007, 2012, 2015; Pinney 2004; Promey 2014; see also Dubuisson 2015; Luiselli, Mohn and Gripenotrog 2013), over the past years I have sought to contribute to breaking conceptual ground for studying images as particular, embodied religious media (Meyer 2012, 2015a).
- 4 What is known as the Second Commandment in the Reformed and Greek Orthodox traditions (Exod. 20.4-6, see also Deut. 5.8-10) is included in the First Commandment for Catholics, Lutherans and Jews. The divergent Christian traditions of numbering only come together again at the end, with Reformed Christianity having the tenth commandment 'Thou shall not covet', and Catholics and Lutherans differentiating it into two commands.
- 5 Kant: 'Vielleicht giebt es keine erhabenere Stelle im Gesetzbuche der Juden, als das Gebot: du sollst dir kein Bildniß machen, noch irgend ein Gleichniß, weder dessen, was im Himmel, noch auf der Erden, noch unter der Erden ist u.s.w. Dieses Gebot allein kann den Enthusiasm erklären, den das jüdische Volk in seiner gesitteten Epoche für seine Religion fühlte, wenn es sich mit andern Völkern verglich, oder denjenigen Stolz, den der Mohammedanism einflößt' (1960 (orig. 1790): 274).

Translation: 'Perhaps in the code of the Jews there is no passage more sublime than the commandment: Thou shall not make onto thee any graven image, or any likeness of a thing that is in heaven above, or that is in the earth beneath, or that is in the water under the earth etc. This commandment alone can explain the enthusiasm that the Jewish people felt for its religion in its civilized epoch when comparing itself to other peoples, or the pride which Mohammedanism instills' (translation mine).
- 6 Latour has a wide definition of the image: 'any sign, work of art, inscription, or picture that acts as a mediation to access something else' (2002: 16).
- 7 German original: 'ein ungreifbares und fernes Sein zu vergegenwärtigen, ihm eine derartige Präsenz zu leihen, die den Raum der menschlichen Aufmerksamkeit völlig

- zu erfüllen vermag. Das Bild besitzt seine Kraft in einer Verähnlichung, es erzeugt eine Gleichheit mit dem Dargestellten.
- 8 He does not take into account that images of God – famously as an old man with a beard – have been made and reproduced over and over again, for instance via illustrated Bibles (see Kruse 2003: chapter 3, and below).
 - 9 Particularly instructive is the attention Kruse pays to differences in evoking a sense of the unseen between artists' stance towards images and theologians' stance towards text. For instance, discussing miniature depictions of the creation of the world in the medieval Lambeth Bible, she demonstrates that the images fill descriptive blanks in the text with concrete visual information (see also Brunotte in this volume) and, in so doing, guide – or even 'occupy' – the imagination of their beholders (2003: 137–55). Analysing the specificity of the visual exegesis undertaken by medieval painters, she identifies an image–text syntax that suggests a priority for images over the text not only on the level of the illustrated Bible, but also in a semantic sense, according to which the things and their names and images were created before the biblical text could narrate the creation of the world.
 - 10 Of course, as an art historian Belting focuses on images. But I do not take this statement to imply that pictures are the only media through which deities become present. In this sense, 'iconic presence' is one mediated presence of the transcendent next to others.
 - 11 In her recent long essay 'After Debrosses: Fetishism, Translation, Comparativism, Critique' (2017), Rosalind Morris insists that fetishism and idolatry were separate discourses, and criticizes Böhme for eliding the difference between them (2017: 165). I take her point that it is important to not project an assumed congruence of fetish and idol on historical texts and to remain alert to the fact that fetish and idol refer to different things. At the same time, however, these two terms were used interchangeably by mission societies such as the NMG (see below). The point here is to trace the actual use of these two terms in encounters between missionaries and Africans, and the repercussions of this use for the ways in which indigenous cult objects are spoken about.
 - 12 With thanks to Angelantonio Grossi for alerting me to the media channel of this pastor and to Azizaa (see below).
 - 13 Original: 'Daher fürchte ich mich, einen Ölgötzen zu verbrennen. Ich habe Angst davor, der Teufelsnarr würde mir etwas antun, obwohl ich (einerseits) die Schrift habe, und weiß, dass Bilder nichts vermögen und weder Leben, Blut noch Geist haben, und doch hält andererseits mich die Furcht [gefangen] und macht, dass ich mich vor einem gemalten Teufel, vor einem Schatten, vor einem Geräusch eines leichten Blattes fürchte und ich gehe aus dem Weg, was ich mannhaft suchen sollte [sc. Bilder zu verbrennen]'.

Chapter 5

- 1 'Aniconism' is a problematic concept for several reasons. First, scholars have deployed 'aniconic' and 'aniconism' as key terms, yet with meanings and values that can vary dramatically' (Gaifman 2017: 343). Secondly, through its via negationis it implies an understanding (and often rejection) of its opposite (see Huntington 2015 with reference to early Buddhism). Thirdly, as an '-ism' it has a propensity to reification and tends to be used in overgeneralizing ways. In my view, there is a long way to go from aniconic ritual practices (de facto aniconicity) to 'aniconism', let alone 'anti-iconism'.

My own use of the term in this chapter is, as a rule, restricted to ritual/cultic contexts where the non-figurative representation of one or several deities and focused communication with a deity is at stake. In such contexts, a non-figural object may function as a representation, a medium of presence and a focus of attention in much the same way as a figurative icon or an image (Schipper 2013).

- 2 Gaifman discusses definitions, examples and comparative perspectives; Aktor, working on data from Hindu traditions, suggests that 'aniconism' be conceptualized as a spectrum rather than dichotomically contrasted to 'iconism'. One article in the collection (Jensen 2017) offers an interesting discussion of biblical data, but the linkage of 'aniconic propaganda' to 'religious seriousness' betrays the author's own, strongly normative, interest. See van Asselt 2007 on the epistemic bind between the prohibition of images and Protestant identity.
- 3 Space does not permit to elaborate here on the roughly contemporaneous temple on Mount Garizim, which seems to have reflected a very similar aesthetic regime (Hensel 2016).
- 4 Nadav Na'aman (2017) has offered one of the first attempts to make sense of the new discoveries within established knowledge. As he rightly states, 'The proximity of the Moza temple to Jerusalem is remarkable, since the Jerusalemite authorities must have considered it a legitimate temple and the cult held therein acceptable' (Ibid.: 4). To Na'aman, however, anthropomorphic and zoomorphic figurines suggest a 'non-Judahite connection' (Ibid.: 10). He therefore suggests that this temple might be a place mentioned in the biblical 'ark narrative' (1 Sam. 4.1b-7.1 and 2 Sam. 6.1-20a), namely the 'House of Obed-Edom the Gittite', that is, a Philistine. This is not the place to discuss the hypothesis in detail. Whether or not the temple was run by Judahites, it will have offered an opportunity structure to local Judahites. What I find remarkable in terms of epistemic regime is that Na'aman has brought in the argument of ethnic and religious distinctiveness only a few months after the preliminary publication of the finds, to the effect that the finds could be conceptually separated from Judahite religion – a typical process of 'othering' as it were, by a highly respected secular historian.

Chapter 6

- 1 I have discussed the historical and conceptual ground against which Kafka's opinions are expressed in Bland 2000: 13–58 and Bland 2008: 155–76.
- 2 The pictures from the Sarajevo Haggadah chosen for display were selected from memory of the oral presentation in Oslo in 2015, as the late professor Bland did not specify the selection in his manuscript (the editors).
- 3 For more recent scholarship, focused on iconography, see Kogman-Appel 2006: 16, 99–110 and Epstein 2011 (passim).
- 4 For the conventional, tendentious wisdom asserting Jewish preference for the word and rejection of the image, see Belting 1994: 7, 42, 144.
- 5 For a translation of the entire responsum and supporting documentation, see Bland 2001.
- 6 For a discussion of the affinity between Talmudic law and Byzantine practice regarding two-dimensional images, see Bland 2004.
- 7 For a more complete English translation of the original Hebrew and supporting documentation, see Bland 2001: 284–5; 294–6.

- 8 From the Scholium to Part IV: Proposition 45 in *The Ethics* in Spinoza 1994.
- 9 For the Arabic original, see Badawi 1985: 51. Compelling doubts about the reliability of Badawi's edition and cogent arguments for the Persian provenance of elements of the text are presented by Zakeri 2004: 173–90. For fuller background on Ḥunayn and this text, see Griffith 2008.
- 10 For biographical background and a full offering of his poetry, see Alḥarizi 2003.
- 11 For the Hebrew original, see Loewenthal 1896: 7.

Chapter 7

- 1 A longer version of this article, containing further illustrations, was originally published in German; see Gruber 2009.
- 2 For a discussion of the term '*kitab munir*' as denoting the Qur'an, see Ayoub 1984: 396.
- 3 The expression '*kitab munir*' is also used to describe other holy scriptures known as 'sacred scrolls' (*zabur*), including the Torah and Gospel.
- 4 For the painting's history, date (910 AH/1505 CE), and attribution to Sultan Muḥammad, see Robinson 1976: 178–9; and for a historical and religious contextualization of its salient visual motifs, see Gruber 2011.
- 5 On this Timurid illustrated manuscript of the 'Book of Ascension', see in particular Gruber 2008; Séguy 1977.

Chapter 8

- 1 I would like to thank Terje Stordalen and Birgit Meyer for helping shape the initial idea and the final product through their invitation to the initial conference at the Zentrum Moderner Orient (ZMO) in Berlin, and for their continuous support as part of the project at the Center for Advanced Studies (CAS) in Oslo. I would also like to acknowledge student research assistants Brent Kennedy, Jeffrey Leddy and Briana Winter for copyediting and proofreading the text. I further extend my appreciation to Sirana Jamkartanian for her generous help with the Arabic sections. Finally, I am most grateful to Refika Sariönder for her uncompromising and persistent criticism of my work. All remaining errors are undeniably mine.
- 2 The Turkish term '*medeniyetler*', properly translated as 'civilizations', might be irritating and requires further contextualization. Here, locals demarcate historical epochs of major empires that once ruled. Besides, *medeniyetler* has a distinct connotation with religion and the religious foundations of a 'civilization' that *Medeniyetler Buluşması* could be translated as the 'Meeting of Religions', and *Antakya Medeniyetler Korosu* as 'Antakya Interreligious Choir'. In recent usage, *medeniyetler* refers to monotheistic religions that are commonly considered religions of the book.
- 3 I follow the Turkish convention of using the proper name of Meryem in conjunction with the honorary title of Mother (Turk.: *Ana*), as used for female saints. Meryem Ana is common among Turkish Christians and Muslims, along with other honorary titles – like that of Saint Mary (Turk.: *Hazreti Meryem* or Hz. *Meryem*). Nevertheless, these terms do not translate easily into a language with an established convention of Virgin Mary. Although Mary is perceived as a virgin in various interpretations of Christianity and Islam, there is no equivalent Turkish convention that would capture the notion

- of the Virgin (Turk.: *Bakire*), and I have not encountered that usage in Hatay. This, however, does not exclude the existence of such a concept, as it becomes apparent in the Arabic liturgical language used among Orthodox Christians in Antakya, where theological notions are pronounced in formula like Virgin Mary (Gr.: *Panagia Maria*; Arab.: *Adra Maryam*) or Mother of God (Gr.: *Theotokos*; Arab.: *Walidat el-Elah*).
- 4 Bodily sensations in Marian veneration and the impact different aesthetic regimes of bodily sensation among Orthodox Christians have on interreligious relations with Muslims have received little attention. Examples of adorations and apparitions of Meryem Ana suggest that in the aesthetic regime the frame shapes the focus, but in bodily sensation the focus shapes the frame. The clergy emphasize aesthetic regimes and laity emphasize bodily sensations.
 - 5 I conducted ethnographic fieldwork on interreligious relations in Hatay during the summers between 2010 and 2015; my interview partners included Eastern Orthodox Christians and Arab Alawite Muslims. My findings are based on participant observation and semi-structured interviews.
 - 6 Orthodox Christians in Antakya traditionally speak Arabic as their mother tongue and the Greek Orthodox Church of Antakya (Turk.: *Antakya Rum Ortodoks Kilisesi*) follows the Greek Orthodox liturgy in the local Arabic dialect (Usluoğlu 2012: 122).
 - 7 Arab Alawites, also Alaouites, Alawis, or formerly Nusayri, a branch of Twelver Shia Islam, venerate Ali ibn-Talib, the cousin and son-in-law of Prophet Muhammad. Alawites, who originated in the ninth century, identify themselves as Muslims. Due to their unique form of Islam that has elements of Christianity in it (Friedman 2010: 67–173), many Sunnites consider Alawites to be heterodox. While their saint veneration at pilgrimage sites remains open for women and children and are commonly visited by members of other religious groups, prayer rituals, essential to their beliefs, are reserved for initiated male members. Most Arab Alawites live in the coastal mountain ranges at the Mediterranean Sea stretching from Lebanon and Syria to Southern regions of Turkey (Procházka-Eisl and Procházka 2010: 49–110; Winter 2016: 141–6, 220–8).
 - 8 The *Theotokos* is usually depicted in a bright blue shirt and a dark red mantle with the Child in a white shirt and a golden cord. The Miraculous Icon in Antakya follows an iconographic tradition of the ‘Virgin of the Passion’ type also named as ‘Our Lady of Perpetual Help’ as represented in a Byzantine icon of the Cretan school (Ferrero 2001: 12; Nes 2005: 58–9).
 - 9 Following the Muslim tradition, the *khamisa* serves apotropaic purposes and aims to bring fertility to the beholder (Apostolos-Cappadona 2005: 355). The *nazarlık* is believed to protect against misfortune caused by the evil eye (Turk.: *nazar*), consisting of an eye-shaped amulet as a blue glass bead with an ‘eye’ made from circles of white and light blue with a dark blue dot in the middle. Particularly in modern Turkey, the blue glass bead gained popularity as part of Turkish folk and tourist culture (Breu and Marchese 2005: 204). The ‘eye in hand charm combines the *hamsa* hand with the blue glass beads of Turkey and Greece and is popular in the Christian world’ (Scranton 2012: 90).
 - 10 It is not unknown for Arab Alawites to venerate icons even those of Meryem Ana (Procházka-Eisl and Procházka 2010: 176, 263, 267).
 - 11 The only exception for a recent recognition of a miraculous icon is the sanctuary of Our Lady of Soufanieh, which became a site for Marian apparitions, where weekly prayers are held in front of an icon which is of a similar Hodegetria type as the Miraculous Icon in Antakya (Bandak 2013: 129–30; Aubin-Boltanski 2014: 512, 515–20).

- 12 This iconographer lived and worked with Father Paolo Dall'Oglio until 2012 in the renowned Al-Khalil community at the Deir Mar Musa al-Habashi, a monastery of the Syriac Catholic Church located some 60 miles (97 kilometres) north of Damascus, where Muslims and Christians prayed and fasted jointly (Loosley 2004; Pénicaud 2016).
- 13 It is a widely held assumption among Eastern Orthodox Christians, that icons are equivalent to the Holy Scripture: 'Icons are words in painting' (Scouteris 1984: 11; see also Pentcheva 2006: 635).
- 14 It should be noted that the Orthodox Church of Antakya is historically ascribed to the diocese of Aleppo and the Orthodox patriarchate in Damascus, not to the patriarchate in Istanbul as one might assume. Furthermore, it is important to emphasize that the divine liturgy is recited and celebrated in Arabic and not in Greek. This is due to historical circumstances which cannot further be developed here.
- 15 Roman Catholic Christians are the primary worshippers in Ephesus with an increase of pilgrimage groups in the twentieth century (Pülz 2010: 252).
- 16 Located some twenty miles (or thirty-two kilometres) north of Damascus, 'deep in Muslim territory' (Kedar 2001: 63), the Saydnaya convent is one of the oldest Christian monasteries hosting a most miraculous Marian icon, as it began in 1168 to dispatch liquid and subsequently 'grow flesh from breasts to navel, emitting from the breasts an oil-like liquid that would heal the sick' (Kedar 2001: 63). This icon 'covered with human flesh, instead of paint' and yielding 'prodigious sweat' (Bacci 2004: 2), is believed to be an icon painted by St. Luke the Evangelist himself (Immerzeel 2007: 16), called 'The Celebrated' (Arab.: *Chaghoura*). Since the Crusades, the *Chaghoura* icon is venerated by Muslims and Christians 'during the feasts of the Assumption (15 August) and Nativity (8 September)' (Immerzeel 2007: 15). Since the crusaders, who 'played an important role in promoting the worship of the 'incarnated icon' [...] and in disseminating the relic of the holy oil' (Bacci 2004: 2), the tradition of shared veneration continued until the twenty-first century (Dalrymple 1998: 186–91).
- 17 Considering that Antakya is home to Christianity's oldest church, and that St. Luke the Evangelist is thought to have written his gospel there (Glover 2009), the Miraculous Icon might hold great significance for Orthodox Christian devotees.
- 18 Arab Alawites recognize dreams and visions as integral to their culture (Kreinath 2014).
- 19 The sanctuaries of local pilgrimage sites are commonly called station (*makam*) or visit (*ziyaret*), indicating the apparition of the saint at that site.

Chapter 9

- 1 This chapter is the result of my fieldwork since 1997 in the city of Lahijan and in its neighbouring villages in the north of Iran. The first initiative to run this project came from the Centre for Anthropological Studies of the Iran Cultural Heritage Organisation, at that time directed by my master's thesis supervisor, Mohamad Mirshokrayi, to whom I am deeply grateful for his kind support and academic advice. My observations on Lahijan's shrines follow from intensive participation observation of Shiite rituals in the shrines and then my interviews with the keepers (*khaadem*) of these shrines and with pilgrims. To make comparisons I then studied the mural paintings of saints' shrines in Isfahan, Shiraz and Dezful. I am deeply grateful to A. Montazerolghaem, F. Mahmoudi and W. Floor for their kind support during my research on this topic. I am also grateful to Birgit Meyer and Terje Stordalen, the editors of this volume, for their comments and feedback on an earlier version of this work.

- 2 The term Twelver refers to its adherents' belief in twelve divinely ordained leaders, known as the Twelve Imams, and their belief that the last imam, Muhammad al-Mahdi, lives in occultation and will reappear as the promised Mahdi. For more information on this topic, see: Amir-Moezzi 2015.
- 3 Hoseyniyeh is a congregation hall for Shiite commemoration of rituals, ceremonies and festivities, especially those associated with the commemoration of the martyrdom of Imam Hoseyn.
- 4 Tekiyeh is a congregation hall for the performance of Ta'ziyeh, which are held during the month of Muharram on the occasion of Imam Hoseyn's martyrdom.
- 5 Saints' shrines and mausoleums.
- 6 According to the Iranian version of Shiism, in 680 AD a battle took place in the desert of Karbala, situated in present-day Iraq. There originated the ritual and myth of Imam Hoseyn, which persist in all Shiite communities. Imam Hoseyn, the champion of the Shiites, the son of 'Ali and Fatemeh and the grandson of the Prophet Muhammad, was, according to tradition, on his way to join the community in Kufa when he, his seventy-two loyal followers, and his entire family were overtaken by the hordes of the Sunni caliph Yazid (b. 647–d. 683 AD) and killed in a bloody battle in that arid desert on the day of Ashura, the tenth of the month of Muharram. All Shiites, but particularly Iranians, congregate each Muharram and the following month, Safar, in a passionate re-enactment of the scene of Karbala.
- 7 For more information on this topic see Landau 2012.
- 8 For more information on this topic see Landau and Van Lint 2015.
- 9 Based on my own fieldwork, 2011.
- 10 For more detailed information on Shiite mural paintings of Iran during the Qajar period, see: Akhaviyan 1996; Calmard 1996: 179; Kamali 2006; Khosronejad 2018; Mahmoudinejad 2009; Mahmoudi and Tawossi 2011; Massé 1938: 297, 305, 38; Mirzaee Mehr 2007; Shad Qazvini 2010.
- 11 'O believers, wine and games of chance and statues and (divining) arrows are an abomination of Satan's handiwork; then avoid it'

Chapter 10

- 1 9/11 has not only reinforced the ancient opposition between the Christian West and Islam, but has also inscribed itself into existing conflicts in Kenya on a national, regional and local level. In Kenya in 1998, thousands of men and women had already experienced the 'Embassy Bombing' of Nairobi and since then have suffered a whole series of terrorist attacks. Under the conditions of heightened vulnerability and aggression, a spiralling process of progressive alienation took place between Muslims and Christians.
- 2 Since the 1980s, a number of Muslim-led welfare organizations, mosques, schools and societies have been founded, most of which were funded by Arab countries, in particular, Saudi Arabia, to provide education, religious training and medical care. They promote a reformed Islam, 'Wahhabism', named after the Muslim scholar Muhammad Ibn Abd al Wahhab (1703–92) that is highly text-oriented and denounces 'un-Islamic' practices such as spirit possession and the celebration of Maulidi.
- 3 When, in 2011, I visited the town of Kwale that has a strong Muslim presence and lies to the south of Mombasa, I realized the impact of reformed Islam centres on big cities such as Mombasa (and Nairobi). Thus, it seems that the gendered withdrawal from (photographic) visibility is mainly an urban phenomenon and has not (yet) reached the rural areas.

Chapter 11

- 1 Transcript provided by the Missionary Department, Archdiocese of Ioshkar-Ola and Marii El, Russian Orthodox Church.
- 2 My understanding of authoritative tradition is based on the work of Talal Asad, who took the term from the philosopher Alasdair McIntyre and introduced it to the anthropology of Islam. For Asad, a tradition is a living, developing conversation where people weigh a variety of past sources to set standards for present behaviour and future trajectories (Asad 2009 [1986]). For applications of the concept to Orthodox Christianity, see Bandak and Boylston 2014; Luehrmann 2018a.
- 3 Irina Vatagina was a student of Mariia Sokolova (monastic name Mother Iuliana, 1899–1981), an iconographer whose life's work connected the Soviet period to the early twentieth-century searches for a renewal of iconography in the classical spirit. Sokolova taught iconography at the Moscow Spiritual Academy from 1958 until the 1970s, and trained many icon painters who were active in the late Soviet and early post-Soviet period, including Vatagina (Yazykova 2010: 125).

Chapter 12

- 1 [...] intelligitur modus quilibet examinandi propriam conscientiam; item meditandi, contemplandi, orandi secundum mentem et vocem; ac postremo alias quasunque spirituales operationes tractandi.
All citations are taken from the Ignatius Jesuit Center edition by E. Jensen (n.d.).
- 2 [...] ratio quaedam componendi loci; pro qua notandum est [...] ut puta de Christo, effingendus erit nobis secundum visionem quandam imaginariam locus corporeus, id quod contemplamur repraesentans.
- 3 [...] imaginando Iesum Christum coram me adesse in cruce fixum. Itaque exquiram mecum rationem, qua Creator ipse infinitus fieri creatura, et ab aeterna vita ad temporariam mortem venire pro peccatis meis dignatus sit.
- 4 quod proprium est Dei et angeli cuiusque boni, veram infundere spiritualem laetitiam animae, quam movent, sublata tristitia et perturbatione omni. [...] bonus quidem leniter, placide ac suaviter, sicut aquae stilla in spongiam illabens.
- 5 [...] angeli, divinae iustitiae gladium ferentes, aequo me animo tulerint, custodierint, suisque etiam iuverint suffragiis.
- 6 [...] pro voti consecutione, poscere maerorem, planctum, anxietatem, et caeteras id genus paenas interiores, ut Christo patienti pro me compatiar.
- 7 Permansit ligatus tota illa nocte. Circumstantes eum satellites illudebant, vexabant [...]
- 8 Iesum flagellis caedi iussit Pilatus; milites eundem spinis coronarunt, atque purpura induerunt.
- 9 Baiulavit Christus crucem suam.
- 10 Inter duos latrones crucifixus fuit, adscripto titulo: Iesus nazarenus rex iudeorum.
- 11 Et divisa sunt vestimenta eius.
- 12 Exclamans (sitio) quando eum aceto potaverunt.
- 13 [...] et latus lancea confossum aquam et sanguinem effudit.
- 14 Sanctissimum eucharistiae sacramentum instituit in signum summae dilectionis.
- 15 Quando etiam lachrimae funduntur, amorem illum provocantes, sive ex dolore de peccatis profluant sive ex meditatione passionis Christi.

- 16 ECCE CRVX DOMINI FUGITE PARTES ADVERSAE VICIT LEO DE TRIBU IUDA
- 17 CHRISTVS VINCIT CHRISTVS REGNAT CHRISTVS IMPERAT CHRISTUS AB
OMNI MALO PLEBEM SUAM DEFENDAT
- 18 est loci cuiusdam imaginaria constructio, in quo videam meipsum coram Deo
sanctisque omnibus, cum desiderio adstantem atque perscrutantem, quonam pacto
ipsi Deo placere queam potissimum.
- 19 pro me intercesserint sancti.
- 20 Rogatus, cum eis mansit, fractoque ipsis pane disparuit; qui subito in Hierusalem
reverse, nuntiaverunt apostolis quomodo vidissent eum, et in fractione panis agnovis-
sent.
- 21 The title of the concluding section is: *Regulae aliquot servandae, ut cum orthodoxa
ecclesia vere sentiamus*: 'Some rules to be observed in order to truly feel with the
orthodox Church'.
- 22 Si quid, quod oculis nostris apparet album, nigrum illa esse definierit, debemus itidem
quod nigrum sit pronuntiare. – See also § 56.

Chapter 13

- 1 The word 'art' was used for the first time in reference to the visual arts like painting and sculpture in the early seventeenth century and the term only came into wider use in the period that followed (*Oxford English Dictionary*: 120). Artistic expertise was previously called 'skill' or 'craft' with the associated word, 'artisan'. Or they were called 'painters' or 'sculptors'. They were members of a particular occupation and were not normally characterized as people with a vision and a calling in the same way that they are today. But with the emergence of Egyptian art from about 3000 BC, we do encounter in certain instances a recognition of the special creative power of visual art and its ability to communicate experience and knowledge in an intense and vivid way, in both secular and religious contexts. Several artists, including Phidias and Leonardo, wanted to share a place at the muses' table with the poets, who were believed to be endowed with a creative imagination and a high degree of learning. The artists of the Renaissance were the first to achieve this distinction. They were elevated to the status of 'twin brothers of the poets' (Lee 1967: 41, 67). The meaning of the word 'art' thus started to make inroads into the art and cultural life of the Renaissance, but not into the meaning of the word itself.
- 2 Theophilus was possibly a Benedictine monk. It has been suggested (particularly by Eckhard Freise) that he is the artisan monk Roger of Helmarshausen. He worked as an artist and author between 1100 and 1107 in St. Pantaleon's Church in Cologne, and he moved to Helmarshausen Abbey in 1107. His main work is called *Diversarum Artium Schedula* (1100–20). See Freise (1981).
- 3 Burke 1967, see particularly the chapters 'Of the Passion caused by the Sublime' and 'Vastness' and 'Infinity': 57–8 and 72–4.
- 4 The original German passage does not use the concept idolatry though: 'Vielleicht gibt es keine erhabenere Stelle im Gesetzbuche der Juden, als das Gebot: Du sollst dir kein Bildnis machen' (Kant 1979: 201). ET, Kant 2000: 156: 'Perhaps there is no more sublime passage in the Jewish Book of Law than the commandment: Thou shalt not make unto thyself any graven image.'
- 5 Buci-Glucksmann 1996: 15. See also Bukdahl 2017: 103.

Chapter 14

- 1 'Gerade aus der biblischen Leerstelle der namenlosen narrativen Funktion gewinnt der Ästhetizismus die Selbstreflexionsformel des "rein Ästhetischen", um in dessen Leere ein epochales Imaginäres einströmen zu lassen' (Pfeiffer 2006: 310).
- 2 John Chrysostom: "Wo eben ein Tanz ist [...]" [...] O welch ein teuflisches Gastmahl! Welch ein satanisches Schauspiel! Welch sündhafter Tanz und noch sündhafterer Tanzlohn! [...] Wo eben ein Tanz ist, da ist auch der Teufel dabei' ([350 -407] (Rohde 2000: 68, 70).
- 3 Richard Strauss (1949: 224): 'Ich hatte schon lange an den Orient- und Judenopern auszusetzen, daß ihnen wirklich östliches Kolorit und glühende Sonne fehlt. Das Bedürfnis gab mir (für meine eigene Oper) wirklich exotische Harmonik ein, die besonders in fremdartigen Kadenzen schillerte, wie Changeant-Seide.'

Afterword

- 1 Calvin 1989: 97. For further discussion, see Morgan 2015: 1–2.
- 2 For discussion of the history of the understanding and portrayal of the resurrection of Jesus, see Bynum 1995: 197–9; on the Cathar heresy, 214–20.
- 3 From Kurth 1963: 214, my translation:

*Has ego crudeles homo pro te perfero plagas
Atque meo morbos sanguine curo tuos.
Vulneribusque meis tua vulnera, mortesque mortem
tollo deus: pro te plasmate factus homo.
Tucque ingrata mihi: pungis mea stigmata culpis
Saepe tuis, noxa vapulo saepe tua.
Sat fuerit, me tanta olim tormenta sub hoste
Iudaeo passum: nunc sit amice quies.*

- 4 Meyer (2006: 20–3) has referred to this as 'sensational form'. I have examined the embodied nature of seeing in religion, Morgan 2012.