Arab, Pooyan Tamimi. "Notes." *Amplifying Islam in the European Soundscape: Religious Pluralism and Secularism in the Netherlands*. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2017. 163–179. Islam of the Global West. *Bloomsbury Collections*. Web. 26 Apr. 2023. <<http://dx.doi.org/10.5040/9781474291460.0012>>.

Downloaded from Bloomsbury Collections, www.bloomsburycollections.com, 26 April 2023, 15:13 UTC.

Copyright © Pooyan Tamimi Arab 2017. Released under a CC BY-NC-ND licence (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/>). You may share this work for non-commercial purposes only, provided you give attribution to the copyright holder and the publisher, and provide a link to the Creative Commons licence.

Notes

Introduction

- 1 I spell the call to prayer as *azan* instead of *adhan* throughout this book, except in book quotations, because the Dutch pronounce it with the *z* sound rather than the *dh* sound, following the Turkish rather than the classical Arabic pronunciation.
- 2 On Top of the World. Saudigazette.com, March 6, 2012.
- 3 Kant discusses the sublime in his *Critique of Judgment*, published in 1790.
- 4 This argument is worked out in Kant's *Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone*, published in 1793.
- 5 All Qur'an citations in this book are taken from the Saheeh International translation.
- 6 Kant uses this phrase several times in his writings, for example in the *Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone* (Part 3, Division 1, Section 3), referring clearly to the Bible, for example Acts 1:24: "Thou, Lord, which knowest the hearts of all men . . ." or Luke 16:5: ". . . but God knoweth your hearts."
- 7 Kant, Immanuel. 1886 [1785]. *The Metaphysics of Ethics*, trans. J. W. Semple, ed. with introduction by Rev. Henry Calderwood. Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, Part 1, Chapter 3, Sec. 15.
- 8 Kant makes this remark at the end of his essay *On the Miscarriage of all Philosophical Trials in Theodicy* of 1791, published in: Kant, Immanuel. 2001. *Religion and Rational Theology*. Translated and edited by Allen W. Wood and George di Giovanni. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, p. 37.
- 9 Malaysian astronaut says his miracle in space "hearing call to prayer." www.worldbulletin.net, February 14, 2012.
- 10 Kant's famous description of philosophical wonder can be found in the *Critique of Practical Reason*, published in 1788: "Two things fill the mind with ever new and increasing admiration and reverence, the more often and more steadily one reflects on them: *the starry heavens above me and the moral law within me*. I do not need to search for them and merely conjecture them as though they were veiled in obscurity or in the transcendent region beyond my horizon; I see them before me and connect them immediately with the consciousness of my existence" (Kant 1997: 133, 5:162).
- 11 See, for example, Corbin 1998, Schmidt 2000, de Vries 2001, Hirschkind 2006, Meyer 2006, 2009, 2012, Eisenlohr 2009a, Latour 2010.
- 12 Mentalism is a strand of thought in the philosophy of language. One of its famous proponents is Jerry Fodor (b. 1935). While Meyer and Hirschkind rightfully criticize

- the mentalist bias in the study of religion, Fodor's arguments are more subtle than at first meets the eye. However, it is not relevant for the scope of this book.
- 13 Hegel's lectures on aesthetics and the history of art were held at the University of Berlin, between 1820 and 1830. They have been widely criticized by art historians, for example Donald Preziosi: "His notion of art, however, was strikingly less complex or subtle than those which had developed in the aesthetic philosophy of the latter half of the eighteenth century. He regarded art as basically a secondary or surface phenomenon, the presentation of common (inner) ideas in diverse (outer) sensual forms—thus harking back to a pre-Baumgarten and pre-Kantian ideology which privileged the Ideal or Thought by *devalourizing* visual knowledge, and by relegating it once again to the realm of confused intelligibility or primitive rationality" (1998: 66).
 - 14 This view has been criticized, among others, by Birgit Meyer, for example in Meyer 2012, note 14. She refers to recent anthropological studies of Christianity that question "the privileging of 'inward' belief above 'outward' ritual practices, content above form, texts above objects" (2012: 12).
 - 15 I have in mind works such as those by the jurist Abu Hanifa (699–767 AD), the philosopher Al-Farabi (872–950 AD), and the poet Hafez (1325/26–89/90 AD), to mention just a few. Distinctions between religious content or essence and nonessential or secondary forms return in various ways and require close comparative reading.
 - 16 Part 3 of Kant's *Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone* is titled "Concerning the victory of the good over the evil principle and the founding of a Kingdom of God on earth."
 - 17 The term *hadith* refers to historic narratives passed on in Islamic tradition that are accounts of the words and deeds of the Prophet Muhammad.
 - 18 The Prophet Muhammad himself is said to have chosen Bilal ibn Rabah as the first *muezzin*, the person appointed to recite the call to prayer (*Encyclopaedia of Islam*, Brill Online, 2014). Bilal was a dark-skinned slave who was freed by the Prophet's companion Abu Bakr. Honored by being chosen to call to prayer, his story has inspired Muslims in modern times to promote a conception of universal racial equality. Though connected to an Islamic message of universalism, the call to prayer has also assisted in the construction of a particular Muslim identity, to be differentiated from Jewish and Christian calls to prayer. Bukhari describes how an agreement was reached on the call to prayer. There were several suggestions, including bell ringing and a light signal or fire (translation by Muhsin Khan, Nr. 580), but in the end a specific set of verses was chosen to be called out loud by the human voice:

Narrated Ibn 'Umar: When the Muslims arrived at Medina, they used to assemble for the prayer, and used to guess the time for it. During those days, the practice of Adhan [azan] for the prayers had not been introduced yet.

Once they discussed this problem regarding the call for prayer. Some people suggested the use of a bell like the Christians, others proposed a trumpet like the horn used by the Jews, but ‘Umar was the first to suggest that a man should call (the people) for the prayer; so Allah’s Apostle ordered Bilal to get up and pronounce the Adhan for prayers. (translation by Muhsin Khan, Nr. 578)

There are also other similar or related stories about the origin of the call to prayer. In one of these, the Prophet is taught the azan by none other than the angel Gabriel himself. Gabriel is best known in Christianity for the annunciation of the coming of the Christ, while in Islam the archangel also delivers God’s revelation to the Prophet Muhammad. The word *azan*, or *adhan*, means “announcement,” and can be interpreted not only as a practical call to prayer, but also as a divine announcement.

The content of the call to prayer can vary slightly depending on the religious school and time (Howard 1981). For example, for the first prayers of the day at dawn, the line “prayer is better than sleep” is added. Though most Muslims follow a Sunni tradition, Shi’ites may add Imam ‘Ali as having the authority of God after pronouncing the *shahada*, bearing witness that there is no deity except God and that Muhammad is His Messenger. Another important (and generally accepted) addition is the *iqama*, a second call to prayer, which is recited when everyone has already gathered in a mosque for prayer and which includes the line “prayer has started.” In most cases, the azan is structured as follows:

Allahu akbar, Allahu akbar (God is greatest, God is greatest—intoned twice)

Ashhadu an la ilaha illa Allah (I bear witness that there is no deity but God—intoned twice)

Ashhadu anna Muhhammadan rasool Allah (I bear witness that Muhammad is the Messenger of God—intoned twice)

Hayya ‘ala’s-Salat (Hurry to prayer—intoned twice)

Hayya ‘ala ‘l-Falah (Hurry to salvation—intoned twice)

Allahu akbar (God is greatest—intoned twice)

La ilaha illa Allah (There is no deity but God; intoned once).

- 19 I am indebted to Kambiz GhaneaBassiri for this formulation.
- 20 See, for example, Appadurai 1996, McAlister 2005, Tweed 2006, Levitt 2007, Csordas 2009.
- 21 See, for example, Bull and Back 2003, Erlmann 2004, Feld and Brenneis 2004, Augoyard and Torgue 2005, Helmreich 2007, 2010, Kheshti 2009, Eisenberg 2010, LaBelle 2010, Samuels et al. 2010, Wilf 2012; for studies of religious soundscapes see Hirschkind 2006, Oosterbaan 2008, Eisenlohr 2009b, Jouili and Moors 2014, Larkin 2014.
- 22 See Metcalf 1996, Lee 1999, Perkins 2010, Khan 2011, Weiner 2014.
- 23 Moskee mag luidspreker gebruiken. *Leidsche Courant*, January 24, 1986.

- 24 According to the Netherlands Institute for Social Research, in 2012 roughly 5 percent of the country's total population of 17 million could be considered "Muslim" (Maliepaard and Gijsberts 2012). This figure, however, lumps together a variety of Muslim identifications, including those who do not or barely engage in Islamic ritual life and those who do not believe in (a) God at all. In general, the 2012 study found that the majority considers itself Muslim, regardless of mosque attendance trends, but did not find a linear "secularization" among second-generation Turks and Moroccans migrants. Around three hundred thousand Dutch Muslims have a Turkish background and another three hundred thousand a Moroccan background, together accounting for roughly 70 percent of the total Muslim population. Other large Muslim groups are Surinamese (34,000), Afghan (31,000), Iraqi (27,000), and Somalian (20,000). The number of Iranians identifying as (Shi'ite) Muslims has exceptionally sharply declined to around 12,000 (from an earlier estimate of 34,000, based on nationality alone), but despite the documented drop in Iranian believers the figures remain misleading as many Iranian nonbelievers identify as Muslim in some situations and will vehemently resist the label in others. Finally, there are small to very small pockets of Muslims from countries such as Pakistan, Egypt, Indonesia, and Tunisia and a very small percentage (less than 1 percent) of Dutch converts (Maliepaard and Gijsberts 2012: 44–45).
- 25 Gebedsoproep "is een grondrecht" en klinkt in zeker 12 steden. *Trouw*, March 20, 2013.
- 26 Calling the faithful and getting complaints. www.nytimes.com, February 25, 2007.
- 27 Ottawa's Muslim call to prayer: There's an app for that. www.ottawacitizen.com, August 30, 2012.
- 28 Granada rediscovers its Muslim roots. www.theguardian.com, December 6, 2003.
- 29 Historic prayer call heard at Stockholm mosque. www.thelocal.se, April 26, 2013.
- 30 L'appel à la prière et le Coran pour la première fois sur une télévision française! www.islametinfo.fr, July 10, 2013.
- 31 Channel 4 to air daily Muslim call to prayer during Ramadan. www.theguardian.com, July 2, 2013.
- 32 Salat, www.johannesgees.com, August 5, 2007.
- 33 Het gevaar is niet ons gebrek, maar ons teveel aan geloof. www.joop.nl, August 6, 2010.
- 34 Communalism aloud: how loudspeakers spark hate in UP. www.hindustantimes.com, July 7, 2014.
- 35 The Revolution is over. *The Economist*, November 1, 2014.
- 36 Uproar over loud prayer calls in Muslim Morocco. www.washingtonpost.com, August 9, 2008.
- 37 Debate heats over calls for banning mosque microphones in Morocco. english.alarabiya.net, August 29, 2011.
- 38 The *muezzin* is the person appointed to recite the call to prayer.

- 39 After controversy, Muslim call to prayer sounds from front of Duke University Chapel. *The Washington Post*, January 16, 2015.
- 40 Laroui was referring to the seventh and final thesis of Wittgenstein's *Tractatus-Logico Philosophicus*: "Whereof one cannot speak, thereof one must be silent."
- 41 Jeroen Vullings. Volgens: Fouad Laroui. *Vrij Nederland*, October 14, 2006.
- 42 In fact, in the early days of Islam when minarets had not yet been constructed, the first muezzin, Bilal, literally called believers to prayer from the rooftop.
- 43 Kant's views on universal ethics and religion are discussed in his *Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone*. Gandhi's notion of pure religion can be found for example in his autobiography, where he writes that the essence of religion is morality.
- 44 Casanova famously divided the modern thesis of secularization into three claims: secularization entails (1) a decline of religious beliefs and practices, (2) institutional differentiation that weakens overall religious institutional power, and (3) the retreat of religion into the private sphere. By showing that these three aspects do not always accompany each other, Casanova could argue that secularization did not automatically imply the decline of public religion. Instead, he described a process of de-privatization of religion that can occur in one country whereas privatization becomes the norm and practice in another. His critique was never a total rejection of the thesis of secularization as a process of modernity, but made a deeper point about history itself: the "mythical account" of secularization should be thoroughly disenchanted, indeed "desacralized" as Casanova put it (1994: 17). By viewing human history as contingent (1994: 39), rather than as a teleological process, he could better account for the persistent presence, declines, revivals, and transformations of collective worship as well as varieties of private religious experiences (e.g., Casanova 2001, Beyer 2006, Taylor 2002, 2007).
- 45 See, for example, Audi and Wolterstorff 1997, Rorty 2003, Rawls 2005, Habermas 2007, An-Nai'm 2010. Besides debates in which Rawls, Habermas, and Rorty are major figures (less known to anthropologists, for example, are reflections by Michael Sandel (Baxter 2011) and Cristina Lafont (2009) on the same topic), other philosophers took the renewed academic interest in religion in a very different direction and actively (re)appropriated religious language for their secular political philosophies, crafting a "faith of the faithless" (Badiou 2003, Critchley 2007, 2012).
- 46 See, for example, Knott 2005, Braidotti 2008, de Haardt 2010, Kong 2010, Wilford 2010, Molendijk, Beaumont and Jedan 2010, Beaumont and Baker 2011, Beckford 2012, Woods 2012.
- 47 The research perspectives on mosque construction include institutional history and governance (e.g., Feirabend and Rath 1996, Schmitt 2003, Knippenberg 2005, 2009, Maussen 2009, Sunier 2009), stylistic analysis (e.g., Dechau 2009, Roose 2009, Vandermarliere et al. 2011), stylistic criticism (e.g., Avciogly 2002, Welzbacher 2008, Erkoçu and Bugdaci 2009, Jackle and Türetken 2011), and ethnography

- (Buijs 1998, Strijp 1998, Lindo 1999, Landman and Wessels 2005, Verkaaik 2010, 2012, Rijken 2014).
- 48 The list is too long to be cited in full here; notable are Bhargava 1999, Bader 2007, Bowen 2007, Srinivasan 2009, Warner et al. 2010, Calhoun et al. 2011, Bowen et al. 2014, Cohen and Laborde 2015.
- 49 A version of this chapter was published in *Material Religion* (Tamimi Arab 2015).

Chapter 1

- 1 By transduction, I mean here to alter the physical nature or medium of a religious call, or perhaps more abstractly a religious “signal.” To convert its pattern into corresponding patterns in a new medium is to transduce it. Silverstein (2003) and Helmreich (2007) have used the term in relation to cultural meaning and translation. Keane (2013) employs it to describe how the “religious work of transduction” can use materiality to create the impression of dematerialization. These different characteristics of transduction—the production of meaning, the possibility of cultural or religious translation, and dematerialization—intersect in this chapter in relation to the conversion of the call to prayer from sound to light signals.
- 2 Moskee gaat gelovigen met lichtsignalen oproepen. *Leidsch Dagblad*, February 26, 2005.
- 3 The idea of “sacrosapes” or “religioscapes” has been picked up in the last decade by a host of cultural thinkers (Knott 2005; McAlister 2005; Tweed 2006; Thomas 2007; Petersen 2010; Oosterbaan 2011), because they perceive a defining role for changing land- and soundscapes in the construction of how we think about globalization.
- 4 Een oproep tot het gebed uit Mekka. *Rotterdamsch Nieuwsblad*, September 19, 1934.
- 5 Moroccan ritual practices of Islam have prompted anthropologists of Islam, Clifford Geertz and, recently, John Bowen, to use words such as “aggressive” and “patriarchal” in their descriptions.

Geertz: “Islam in Barbary was—and to a fair extent still is—basically the Islam of saint worship and moral severity, magical power and aggressive piety, and this was for all practical purposes as true in the alleys of Fez and Marrakech as in the expanses of the Atlas or the Sahara” (1971 [1968]: 9).

Like Geertz, Bowen contrasts Moroccan and Indonesian Islamic practices and describes the former as “patriarchal,” for example in the case of the ritual sacrifice of an animal, which in the Moroccan case signifies the “virility, power, and self-sufficiency of the male, as opposed to the female” (2012: 83). Geertz’s use of the term “aggressive” may be problematic but not wholly disconnected from Bowen’s descriptions of “patriarchal” practices.

- 6 Statistieken 2012 Tweede Kamerverkiezingen. www.stemwijzer.nl.
- 7 “Geen gebedsoproep via luidspreker.” *Algemeen Dagblad*, March 28, 2007.
- 8 Swiss Ban Building of Minarets on Mosques. *The New York Times*, November 30, 2009.
- 9 Wat is belangrijker: monumentale status oude kerk of nieuwe moskee? www.elsevier.nl, February 2, 2016.
- 10 French Mosque’s Symbolism Varies With Beholder. *The New York Times*, December 27, 2009. Also see the mosque’s website: www.lamosqueedemarseille.com.
- 11 The idea that glass and the color white stand for transparency is popular in the Netherlands, where the city halls of Amsterdam and The Hague and also recently constructed public libraries such as in Amsterdam or Delft are designed to reflect such an “open experience.” Tourists also often find the lack of drawn curtains and extensive use of glass in Dutch residential buildings striking. While the ideological connection of ideas of transparency with the architectural use of glass may be dominant in several European countries or simply reflect global trends, it is particularly strong in the Netherlands. Protestant churches in the Netherlands, however, cannot be characterized by a similar use of glass.
- 12 Nota van B&W. 25 April 2006. Registratienummer 2006 I 13038. Gemeente Haarlemmermeer.
- 13 Ayaan Hirsi Ali is a former member of the House of Representatives on behalf of the Liberal Party. She made the film *Submission*, a highly controversial critique of Islam, together with Theo van Gogh, who was murdered by a radical Muslim.
- 14 Moskee gaat gelovigen met lichtsignalen oproepen. *Leidsch Dagblad*, February 26, 2005.
- 15 Isaac Weiner has documented a comparable understanding of Christian calls to prayer where a man defended the right to ring church bells in court, saying: “I do not know anything more touching or more thoughtful than that arrestation, even for a moment, which a man will involuntarily make when he hears these bells, reminding him that the Saviour took upon him our flesh for our advantage” (Weiner 2014: 62). Precisely because of the element of hearing the call involuntarily, thus creating a public community of listening religious subjects, it could never be replaced by pocket watches.
- 16 William J. T. Mitchell defends the interesting thesis that “all media are mixed media” (2005: 260). There are no purely visual media, but also no purely auditory media. This observation does not foreclose the possibility to distinguish visual from auditory media, but reveals that a phenomenon such as the call to prayer tradition from mosque buildings is much more than merely an auditory experience. In Chapter 4, for example, we see in more detail that the azan is also experienced as tactile.
- 17 I contacted Repaux in 2012, and fellow anthropologist Corina Duijndam interviewed him on my behalf by video call.

- 18 For example, see Ibn Sina's short *Treatise on Love* (Fackenheim 1945).
- 19 Butler, Alfred J. 1880. The ancient pharos at Alexandria. *The Athenaeum*, November 20, p. 681.
- 20 More recently, Robert Hillenbrand has argued the contrary, namely that in the early Islamic period the word *manar* was semantically disconnected from fire or light, and that it indicated a place that could signal without the presence of a literal light signal (1992: 132).
- 21 Azhar rejects light adhan. *The Siayasad Daily*, March 8, 2012. www.siasat.com.
- 22 Dit is 'm dan, de nieuwe moskee in Enschede. www.tubantia.nl, February 18, 2014.
- 23 Enschedese buurt witheet na moskeetest. www.tubantia.nl, November 26, 2015.

Chapter 2

- 1 Bijna miljoen kijkers voor The Passion. ANP, April 22, 2011.
- 2 1,7 miljoen kijkers voor The Passion. ANP, April 6, 2012.
- 3 The word *procession* is more generic in the English language than its equivalent in Dutch, which refers more specifically to a religious ritual. Because The Passion is different from the traditional procession, it raises the question of whether such an event, in which even nonbelievers are also welcome, is a "real" procession. However, it must be noted that processions have always been subject to change and that there is not a single archetypical procession that would be more real or authentic than The Passion, which can also be described as a musical, a popular media form of our time. Peter van Rooden (1996: 40) described a comparable process in the nineteenth century: religious mobilizations were enabled by the use of what were then newly available media, for example "organizations, magazines, mass meetings, petitions, political parties, and unions." The Passion, since 2011, has annually made use of the media of its time. If we indeed view religions as *media*, as so many scholars of religion do (Meyer 2009; Eisenlohr 2009a; Weiner 2014), then the question is not whether The Passion is a real procession but how contemporary Christianity is developing in European countries like the Netherlands. One commentator noted, for example, that The Passion is strongly based on a secular "events culture" (*evenementencultuur*), and that it symbolizes the new role of Christianity in a mainly de-churched and secularized country: "Christianity is not presented as a ritual way of life with fixed habits (such as going to church on Sunday) but as a single special event" (Emiel Hakkenes. Kerst als tv-spektakel: is dit het nieuwe Christendom? Trouw.nl, December 24, 2013).
- 4 Since 2004, the Dutch Reformed Church merged with other Protestant churches to form the Protestant church in the Netherlands (*Protestantse Kerk in Nederland*, PKN).

- 5 Wel Nederlands, geen Nederlander. *De Volkskrant*, June 22, 2002.
- 6 The term “public worship” is used in *A Letter Concerning Toleration*, written by Locke during his exile in Holland.
- 7 The societal distinction between private and public churches ensured that a single church had a monopoly over the public manifestations of worship. The public church, however, was not a state church that each subject of the Republic was automatically a member of.
- 8 Ivan Kalmar made a similar remark based on a comparison of nineteenth-century Jewish struggles to build synagogues in Europe with that of Muslims today (2013: 172).
- 9 Toespraak Maxime Verhagen over populisme. www.nrc.nl, June 28, 2011.
- 10 Maxime Verhagen is a Roman Catholic and member of the Christian Democratic Appeal (CDA). For his speech, see CDA Symposium Populisme, June 28, 2011.
- 11 Sarkozy joins multiculturalism attack. *Financial Times*, February 10, 2011.
- 12 Ultimately, this also requires rethinking how Enlightenment philosophers were influenced by the Global West of their time, being more familiar with religious others, Buddhists, Muslims, and others, than is sometimes recognized. Locke and Voltaire, for instance, already included Islam and Muslims in their understanding of “universal toleration” (e.g., Forst 2013: 292).
- 13 The northern provinces of the Netherlands have been historically known as roughly more Protestant while the southern provinces close to Belgium are known as more Catholic.
- 14 Corbin (1998) describes, for example, how French soldiers executed citizens in the countryside unwilling to hand over their church bells, or the rather violent silencing of the Notre Dame in Paris, which could not ring bells for ten years after the French Revolution. He writes that in the dark episodes following the French Revolution, church bell sounds could evoke emotions such as “fear, exhilaration, panic, and horror” (1998: 196). In the nineteenth century, “Through bells an individual was better able to apprehend the identity of the group to which he belonged. They helped him locate himself in space and time. They audibly proclaimed to him the order of the society within which his life unfolded, and made manifest the power of the constituted authorities” (Corbin 1998: 158). Thus, for Catholics in the nineteenth-century French countryside, “A bell tower without bells served as a constant reminder of a painful lack” (1998: 201).
- 15 The practice of carrying a cross was initiated by Emperor Justinian II and made mandatory after the Second Council of Nicaea.
- 16 The Catholic Church did not officially accept democracy until 1944, and only for states but not for the Vatican itself (Bader 2011: 32).
- 17 The Dutch government organized the State Commission Van Schaik to produce recommendations for a significant number of constitutional revisions deemed necessary after World War II. Major areas of concern were revisions

- to parliamentary procedures, decolonization, and the European Coal and Steel Community.
- 18 The State Commission Cals-Donner was mainly preoccupied with suggestions for renewing the Dutch electoral system, and delivered its final report in 1971.
 - 19 Handelingen II, 1987–88, 41, January 27, 1988, p. 2238.
 - 20 Ibid., p. 2250.
 - 21 Ibid., p. 2245.
 - 22 There was some pressure, not only to allow a plurality of religious sounds, but also to limit the power of churches to enforce quiet. The so-called Sunday Law (*Zondagswet*) was criticized, but survived the constitutional disestablishment of the 1980s. In 2012, the Dutch House of Representatives (*De Tweede Kamer*) accepted an amendment proposed by Democrats 66 and the Liberal Party to grant municipalities the right to determine for themselves whether they wanted to enforce Sunday quiet, instead of assuming that the Sunday Law should apply to the entire country. Although Dutch constitutional secularism may be biased in favor of Protestant notions of proper religion, it has the capability to reform itself to lessen such biases. Similarly, Weiner describes how churches in nineteenth-century United States were faced with limitations due to increasingly secular governance: “Just as their right to make noise was being called into question, so too was their right to enforce quiet, at least on Sundays, and the shifting responses to these auditory practices mediated, in part, how Protestant Americans experienced the dramatic changes of the nineteenth century” (Weiner 2014: 21). It is therefore important not to conflate political and constitutional secularism with Protestantism (see Chapter 3), even though there are historic crossings, exchanges, and overlaps between these general concepts.
 - 23 Handelingen II, 1987–88, 41, January 27, 1988, p. 2252.
 - 24 Weiner (2014) describes a similar development in the United States, where court cases in the twentieth century affirmed cities’ rights to regulate religious sounds but not to ban them.
 - 25 Moderne Islam. Gebruik van microfoon. *Het Vaderland: staat- en letterkundig nieuwsblad*, October 8, 1938.
 - 26 Een oproep tot het gebed uit Mekka. *Rotterdamsch Nieuwsblad*, September 19, 1934.
 - 27 De muezzin is verdwenen. *Het Vaderland: staat- en letterkundig nieuwsblad*, March 14, 1930.
 - 28 The recordings have been recently digitized by Leiden University, but have not yet been made available to the public. Anne van Oostrum has published on the recorded music (2012). On at least one of the recordings, street musicians can be heard playing together with the call to prayer.
 - 29 De moskeeën van Kairo. *De Tijd: godsdienstig-staatkundig dagblad*, August 14, 1936.

- 30 Moderne Islam. *Nieuwe Leidsche Courant*, October 10, 1938.
- 31 Turksch en Arabisch. *De Indische courant*, November 25, 1932.
- 32 Oost-Java. *Het nieuws van den dag voor Nederlandsch-Indië*, January 6, 1938.
- 33 De Moskee: Heiligdom der Moslims. De Moskee is het Middelpunt van het Religieuze Leven. *De locomotief: Samarangsch handels- en advertentie-blad*, June 1, 1948.
- 34 De zilveren hamer. *Leidsch Dagblad*, September 23, 1966.
- 35 Moskeeën. *Limburgsch dagblad*, August 17, 1967.
- 36 Uitkijkpost in een moslimse wereld. *Nieuwe Leidsche Courant*, August 12, 1972.
- 37 Islam en kerk moeten leren samenleven. *Nieuwe Leidsche Courant*, March 4, 1968.
- 38 Oproep imam gelijk aan klok luiden van kerken. *Leidsch Dagblad*, January 28, 1988.
- 39 Moskee mag luidspreker gebruiken. *Leidsche Courant*, January 24, 1986.
- 40 Oproep. *Leidsch Dagblad*, October 22, 1986.
- 41 Nu ook luidspreker bij moskee Rembrandtstraat. *Leidsche Courant*, February 5, 1986.
- 42 Islamiëten bij Goekoop op bezoek. *Leidsche Courant*, February 18, 1986.
- 43 Kerken staan tolerant tegenover oproep imam. *Leidsche Courant*, February 10, 1988.
- 44 Moskee heeft geen vergunning nodig voor elektronische oproep tot gebed. *Leidsch Dagblad*, October 23, 1993.
- 45 Haci Bayram Moskee krijgt rol in integratie Turkse gemeenschap. *Leidsch Dagblad*, December 6, 1997.
- 46 For the sake of brevity, this chapter largely omits the important history of pillarization in the Netherlands in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. It should be remarked, however, that this history is quite essential to understanding the Dutch consensus model of governance (Lijphart 1999), which has also affected the governance of religious diversity, for example the right to organize schools according to religious lines including, more recently, Islamic schools (Sunier 2004). Also, the standard narrative of pillarization and de-pillarization has been recently nuanced by Peter van Dam (2011, 2014), who proposes a more gradualist account of modern Dutch history rather than the thesis and antithesis of pillarization and de-pillarization. For our purpose, it is important to note that, despite the official Procession Prohibition, pillarization, and polarization, Catholic (public) presence was normalized throughout the twentieth century, which finally also led to legal change, albeit after significant secularization of the populace and de-churching (*ontkerkelijking*) from the 1960s onward.
- 47 De processie is terug—katholieke emancipatie voltooid. *De Volkskrant*, June 21, 2005.
- 48 Een optocht voor de jarige profeet. *Trouw.nl*, February 14, 2011.
- 49 Ruim 7000 pelgrims bij Stille Omgang Amsterdam. *Nu.nl*, March 17, 2013.
- 50 www.stille-omgang.nl, accessed February 2014.
- 51 Sinds ontzuiling niet eerder zoveel sacramentsprocessies. *Katholiek Nederland.nl*, May 25, 2008.

Chapter 3

- 1 Contemporary liberals such as Kwame Anthony Appiah, Amartya Sen, and Martha Nussbaum have devoted much of their writings to refute parochial and xenophobic conceptions of liberalism that are informed by a supposed “clash of civilizations” (Appiah 2005, 2007; Sen 2007, 2009; Nussbaum 2012).
- 2 Geen gebedsoproep via luidspreker. www.ad.nl, March 28, 2007.
- 3 Henk Kamp. Immigratie en Integratie. VVD Tweede Kamer-fractie, November 12, 2007.
- 4 Ibid. (no page numbers).
- 5 Ibid. (no page numbers).
- 6 The European Court of Human Rights found that the SGP’s position on women’s political participation is “unacceptable regardless of the deeply-held religious conviction on which it is based.” July 10, 2012, *Staatkundig Gereformeerde Partij v. The Netherlands*.
- 7 At the time, there was an antiblasphemy law in the Netherlands that was not applied in practice. There have been many critical debates on this archaic law, especially after the murder of filmmaker Theo van Gogh, and it was removed from Criminal Law in 2013.
- 8 “Straks de hele dag dat islam-gejammer.” www.volkskrant.nl, April 18, 2004.
- 9 “Geen gebedsomroep vanaf moskee Zeist.” www.digibron.nl, Kenniscentrum Gereformeerde Gezindte, August 16, 2004.
- 10 SGP legt zich neer bij gebedsoproep. www.trouw.nl, September 3, 2004.
- 11 Antwoorden op kamervragen over islamtische gebedsoproepen via geluidsinstallaties en gemeentelijke autonomie hierbij. www.rijksoverheid.nl, May 11, 2007.
- 12 VROM—Wet milieubeheer, Besluit woon- of verblijfsgebouwen milieubeheer, article 1.1.3.
- 13 De klokkenluider van Tilburg. www.omroepbrabant.nl, December 13, 2007; Tilburgs klokkenluiden aan banden gelegd. www.omroepbrabant.nl, April 20, 2009.
- 14 Pastoor mag Tilburgse klok ook van Raad van State niet luiden. www.omroepbrabant.nl; Uitspraak Raad van State, zaaknummer 201011441/1/H3, July 13, 2011.
- 15 Oproep vrijdaggebed moskee Middelburg doet “pijn en verdriet.” www.pzc.nl, September 29, 2015.
- 16 ASP Kenmerk: Dagelijkse gebedsoproep Deventer Centrum Moskee. October 26, 2012.
- 17 Antwoorden op de Kamervragen van de leden Van Klaveren en Wilders (PVV) over “de dagelijkse imperialistische moskeeoproep.” April 8, 2013, referentie 2013-0000042786.
- 18 Pim Fortuyn was a politician whose critical views of multiculturalism, and Islam in the Netherlands in particular, significantly impacted the Dutch political landscape.

- He was assassinated in 2002 by Volkert van der Graaf, an environmental and animal rights activist who said that he murdered Fortuyn for targeting Muslims. Theo van Gogh was a film director who criticized the position of women in Islam in a film entitled *Submission* that he coproduced with Somali-born politician Ayaan Hirsi Ali. He was murdered in 2004 by Mohammed Bouyeri, a Moroccan-Dutch Muslim. Peter van der Veer has analyzed the impact of these murders on Dutch debates surrounding Islam and religious tolerance (2006).
- 19 It is questionable whether labels of left and right are so easily applicable to Dutch politics, as the Liberal Party has stances that would be understood in other contexts as left-wing, such as their affirming of the rights to abortion and euthanasia. The same can be said about the Party for Freedom, which occasionally defends civil and social rights ordinarily associated with the left such as gay marriage or better pensions for retired citizens. In the Netherlands, however, these parties are described in public debates as right wing.
 - 20 SP Zutphen: dagelijkse azan voorkomen. www.destentor.nl, August 11, 2014.
 - 21 Marokkaanse opent wijnbar in Rotterdam: "Ik ben de regisseur van mijn eigen leven." *Metro*, February 8, 2014.
 - 22 Küçük and Boulayoun showed me the correspondence between the Islam Democrats and the mayor's advisor.
 - 23 Moskee heeft geen vergunning nodig voor elektronische oproep. *Leidsch Dagblad*, October 23, 1993.
 - 24 "Dat de gebedsoproep een recht is, betekent nog niet dat je er gebruik van moet maken." www.wijblijvenhier.nl, March 3, 2013.
 - 25 Gebruik het recht op de gebedsoproep! www.wijblijvenhier.nl, April 5, 2013.
 - 26 Gebedsoproep, thuisgevoel voor moslims. April 5, 2013. www.moslimvandaag.nl, Jaargang 1, Nummer 1.
 - 27 "Gebedsoproep goed voor integratie." www.telegraaf.nl, February 7, 2013.
 - 28 For explanations by Bhargava and Bader of what is meant by weak and strong "establishment" and, for example, the differences between a church and a religion that could be established, see Bhargava 2010a, b, and Bader 2007.

Chapter 4

- 1 The idea of "practical schemas" as a methodological framework for studying contingencies and multilayered interactions between European states and their Muslim citizens has been recently worked out by Bowen et al. (2014). We read that "... schemas classify persons, erect boundaries, and inform practices" (p. 256), that schemas have "grammars of justification" (p. 12), that they include "... complexes of ideas, norms, values, and emotions" (p. 3). Practical schemas remind the reader of Wittgenstein's pragmatic philosophy of language. Wittgenstein described

the phenomenon of how social practices, “language games,” shape meanings. In philosophical language, practical schemas not only contain certainties, epistemological backgrounds from which one can head out, but also determine what counts as a candidate for being true or false.

- 2 While the belief in Rousseau’s Noble Savage has declined considerably, the discipline of cultural anthropology itself can also be viewed as still too nostalgic for “endangered cultures.” It is important to take seriously the emotions of the indigenous white Dutch majority, as Duyvendak does. However, researchers of the politics of home should not apply traditional anthropological nostalgia to the “natives” who are now “endangered” in the Netherlands. This is not because white majorities deserve less hermeneutic charity than supposedly weak black minorities, of course, but because anthropological nostalgia itself is too orientalist a mode of interpretation to begin with. Anthropological nostalgia, despite its good intentions, has always been closely linked to colonial nostalgia and exaggerated cultural relativism which turns the other into a radical other. A new generation of anthropologists interested in the question of preserving heritage, however, has criticized their discipline’s nostalgic presuppositions (e.g., Silverstein 2004; Bissel 2005; Özyürek 2006; Kendall 2009; Berliner 2012). In our case, preserving heritage is a matter of competing nostalgias. While one group wants to preserve a “Dutch landscape” and demands “cultural integration,” the other desires to transport heritage in the form of the mosque and azan, demanding “cultural recognition.”
- 3 In Chapter 1, the concept of transduction was used to describe the proposal to transform the azan from sound to light signals. The azan is also transduced, however, as it enters the human body. The penetrating aspect of sound is itself a form of transduction, but what is involved here cannot be reduced to a step from the auditory to the tactile because the meaning of the azan, depending on context, affects listeners on a broader multisensory and visceral level.
- 4 Moskee is prima, dagelijks gebed niet. *de Stentor*, June 29, 2012.
- 5 Dagelijkse oproep tot gebed is stap te ver. *de Stentor*, June 30, 2012.
- 6 Just like Protestant Christianity, Islam is complex and multifaceted. In some instances, Muslims refuse to separate form and content, such as in the required bodily movements while praying, and at other times they separate what is in the heart from what is done by the body. One would need to simplify general concepts such as “Protestant Christianity” and “Islam” to an extreme, covering a great number of countries and millions of people, to arrive at a simplistic conclusion that Protestants make a fundamental distinction between the invisible church of the heart and the church as building, whereas Muslims would not distinguish hearing the call to prayer from their belief in Allah.
- 7 Moskee een week op proef met azan. *de Stentor*, July 19, 2012.

- 8 Internal letter from the municipality to the VVD councillor Ledebor. Kenmerk BDO/722397. Onderwerp: Schriftelijke vragen ex art. 45 RvO over minaretspeakers.
- 9 Scheffer, Paul, and Roelofs, René. *Land van Aankomst*. International Documentary Film Festival Amsterdam 2013.
- 10 For a critical history of Dutch immigration policies, see: de Jong, Lammert. 2011. *Being Dutch, more or less*. Amsterdam: Rozenberg Publishers.
- 11 Bouw moskee laat op zich wachten. *Deventer Dagblad*, September 28, 1999.
- 12 Bezwaren tegen moskee ongegrond. *Deventer Dagblad*, October 30, 1999.
- 13 Verzet tegen de moskee gaat door. *Deventer Dagblad*, November 5, 1999.
- 14 Een wedloop van moskeeën. *NRC Handelsblad*, November 5, 1999.
- 15 Nog even geen dagelijkse azan. *de Stentor*, July 3, 2012.
- 16 College maant moskee tot overleg. *de Stentor*, June 30, 2012.
- 17 Samsom: "azan" in harmonie oplossen. *de Stentor*, July 20, 2012.
- 18 Bloomberg on Mosque: "A Test of Our Commitment to American Values." Blogs.wsj.com, August 24, 2010.
- 19 Obama Strongly Backs Islam Center Near 9/11 Site. *The New York Times*, August 13, 2010.
- 20 I thank anthropologist Manon Tiessink for her notes and recordings of this evening, which I could not attend.
- 21 Promoting "moderate" Islam, and therefore trying to influence definitions and practices of Islam, is a fluctuating policy of Dutch secular local governance. Justus Uitermark, Jan Willem Duyvendak, and Jan Rath describe how local government in the capital has tried to utilize and promote a "moderate Islam" versus "radical Islam." In Foner et al. 2014, Chapter 6.
- 22 Resultaat discussie bewoners en bestuur van de moskee. Deventer Mediators, February 13, 2013.
- 23 Peiling over dagelijkse azan. Website Gemeente Deventer, January 21, 2013.
- 24 Notaris bewaakt proces rond azan. *de Stentor*, January 22, 2013.
- 25 Weiner describes how the Hamtramck demand for the daily azan resulted in a poll in which a "No" vote would count as upholding Muslims' rights to the azan, whereas a "Yes" vote would leave the azan question unresolved. Local council members were keen on avoiding the courtroom and used this deliberately confusing method to let the people speak in democratic fashion, although Weiner adds "it was not clear what the people had said!" (2014: 190). Nevertheless, the result by a narrow margin was that the daily azan was allowed and the issue never made it to court.
- 26 Vragen bezorgde PvdA over azan-enquête. *de Stentor*, January 31, 2013.
- 27 Geschreeuw doet azan verstommen. *de Stentor*, July 7, 2012. J. Mostert reacted to this article a few days later, stating that the sound of the church and the azan produce different sonic experiences. In: Oproep tot gebed niet te vergelijken met

- lawaaï trein. *de Stentor*, July 13, 2012. The chairman of the mosque reacted to these criticisms by explicitly defending the analogy with church bells, not because he thought that the experience of hearing church bells was exactly the same as hearing the azan, but with a reference to “equal rights in a multicultural society.”
- 28 Moskee Deventer mag dagelijks azan laten klinken. *de Stentor*, March 8, 2013.
- 29 Weiner similarly describes how disputes over religious sounds were brought to American courts in the nineteenth and mid-twentieth centuries. As a result, when Muslims in the twenty-first century wanted to amplify the azan, jurisprudence and law had already been shaped to the extent that taking the matter to court would be futile (since mosques in the United States have the right to amplify the azan). The azan controversy in the town of Hamtramck therefore never made it to a US courtroom (2014: 14).
- 30 Ever since the agreement, the mosque had generally amplified the call to prayer every day. On some days there was no muezzin available so the call was not amplified. Only about four to five people are allowed to call to prayer, and when they are not available the call is not amplified.
- 31 Also see Eisenberg, Avigail, and Spinner-Halev, Jeff (eds.). 2005. *Minorities Within Minorities. Equality, Rights and Diversity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 32 Zutphens college wil dialoog over azan. *De Stentor*, March 6, 2014.
- 33 Oproep tot gebed blijft. *Algemeen Dagblad*, November 11, 2013.
- 34 Moskee Kuipersdijk wil elke dag van zich laten horen. www.tubantia.nl, July 5, 2013.
- 35 PvdA voor bouw moskee, maar tegen hoorbare oproep tot gebed. Enschede.pvda.nl, February 10, 2016.
- 36 Een moskee vindt Enschede prima, maar hoe ga je de geluidsoverlast tegen? *De Volkskrant*, April 22, 2016.
- 37 Burgemeester wijst Enschedese raadsleden op stemgedrag moskee: “Ik verdedig de Grondwet.” www.tubantia.nl, March 23, 2016.

Epilogue

- 1 This view is defended in detail by Rainer Forst in his book *Tolerance in Conflict* (2013), in which he makes a systematic-philosophical analysis of the development of the concept of tolerance throughout European history.
- 2 Vrede van Utrecht magazine. September 2012, and www.vredevanutrecht2013.nl.
- 3 On the other hand, schizophonia can also be appropriated as an empowering concept, for example to criticize the leveling effect of one master azan for the entire city of Cairo instead of the cacophony of voices, which are also mechanically reproduced through loudspeakers.

- 4 I am thinking of the wax cylinder recordings of the call to prayer in Jeddah in 1908 and 1909 (Chapter 2, note 28).
- 5 Islam center stage as Turkish election campaign enters final week. www.reuters.com, May 30, 2015.
- 6 In Lessing's parable of the rings, God desired to bestow the ring of true revelation to his sons, so he had two identical copies made which were crafted so perfectly that He himself could not anymore identify which of the three was the original. The result was the impossibility to distinguish whose faith is the true faith, born out of the equal love of God for his children.
- 7 Of course, when the religious other is an object of racism, as when a person objects not merely to the azan but discriminates against people who have the cultural phenotype of "Muslim" in daily life, tolerance is not the solution. In practice, however, the line between subtle forms of racism and intolerance toward religious sounds can be difficult to determine.
- 8 Moskee in de Stad. Een multiculturele droom anno 2014. Interactive online documentary: moskeeindestad.nl, episode 5.